

**Answer to Editor comments**

soil-2021-5 Submitted on 16 Jan 2021

Nonlinear turnover rates of soil carbon following cultivation of native grasslands and subsequent afforestation of croplands

Guillermo Hernandez-Ramirez, Thomas J. Sauer, Yury G. Chendev, and Alexander N. Gennadiev

*Executive Editor Decision: Publish subject to technical corrections (18 Jun 2021) by Jeanette Whitaker*

*Comments to the Author: Dear Authors*

*Many thanks for submitting this paper to SOIL. I am pleased to inform you that after the revision process your manuscript is now accepted for publication in SOIL, there is just one minor revision point requested by the topical editor which requires attention.*

*I look forward to seeing the paper published.*

*with best wishes*

*Jeanette Whitaker*

*Executive Editor Topical Editor Decision: Publish subject to technical corrections (16 Jun 2021) by Carolina Boix-Fayos*

*Comments to the Author:*

*Dear Authors,*

*Many thanks for addressing all the changes so efficiently. I think you have made a very good job. I just have a very minor question on your statement on line 162, and I would like if you could consider rewording the sentence, please.*

*My doubt is that it is highly debatable that the semi-arid factor is the cause of low erosion, it is possible that this is one of the reasons in your study areas, but in many other semiarid areas, there are torrential rainfalls concentrated in some moments of the year, leading to high rates of erosion. Thus I suggest changing the phrases in lines 162 and 163 as follows (or in a similar way):*

*"We assume that semiarid climate, enough vegetation cover and low slope limit water and wind erosion"*

*Furthermore I suggest to change the last section called "Summary" into "Conclusions", I think the style of the paragraphs respond more to a conclusion with a "take-home message" than to a summary.*

*Cheers, Carolina*

**Answers to Editor comments:**

Thanks for the valuable feedback. We sincerely appreciate the acceptance.

We agree and have now implemented these two changes in the updated manuscript version. We included "We assume that semiarid climate, enough vegetation cover and low slope limit water and wind erosion" as well as "Conclusions".