

# Soil

grammar and writing style: the whole paper is affected by several grammatical issues with improper use of the scientific English style (see the syntax);

**response:** We have hired a professional to polish the language of the article

Introduction: too long and not really focused on paper background;

**response:** We expounded the leaching hazards of herbicides in soil, as well as some specific factors (background) affecting leaching, so we need to study the specific leaching behavior of the herbicides (purpose), and finally introduce the research methods (means). It is considered to be concerned with the background of the article, please tell us the detail

- Materials and Methods: too questionable approaches. For example, authors collected soil samples from the Ap surface horizon (I suppose: 0–20 cm depth; NOT LAYER!) from four major rice-producing regions throughout China. However, as clearly shown by soil classification, this method introduced a significant variability that the authors do not take into account or justify in their results. Additionally, from a statistical analysis viewpoint, the authors just stated that "statistical analysis were performed in SPSS Statistics 22.0", without explaining which kind of data treatment they used. This is a dramatic issue since without explaining statistical approach and previous data pretreatment, this Reviewer, as every other serious Reviewer worldwide, cannot judge if obtained outcomes are affected by mistakes in data treatments;

**response:** we have change to the surface horizon; and we used the LSD for standard deviation tests, and Linear Regression for linear correlations between different factors and leaching

- Results and Discussion: results and the following discussion are too speculative and very often justified by using very old references or without any comparison with previous studies. In this last case, this is not due to the novelty of the paper's outcomes but just, in this Reviewer's opinion, to the overspeculative comments of the authors.

**response:** Before this article, we studied the adsorption of BH in soil and the influencing factors(Adsorption–desorption behavior of benzobicyclon hydrolysate in different

agricultural soils in China, Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety 202 (2020) 110915. This article wants to verify the relationship between the adsorption results and the leaching results, so this article is studied, so this article is based on the discussion in the previous paper. description, so I don't think there are speculative comments