SOIL Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-85-RC1, 2020

Interactive comment on "Constructed Technosols are key to the sustainable development of urban green infrastructure" *by* Maha Deeb et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 9 March 2020

Dear authors

the article could become very interesting but urgently needs extensions. When you are writing a review article on constructed soils, one would expect an overview of results/findings/suggestions for your suggested categories: 1. Constructed Technosols for parks and squares with lawns 2. Constructed Technosols for developing tree-lined streets 3. Constructed Technosols for stormwater management 4. Constructed Technosols for urban farming 5. Constructed Technosols as a solution to reclaim derelict land I couldn't detect any table or figure describing which ranges of soil properties (chemical, physical and biological) occur or should have and why. The author group is large and experienced enough to distribute these five substrates to design such tables and figures. In these tables/figures, I suggest including international limits i.e. environ-

mental acts in order to show where limitations in the use of urban substrates are. Some more questions raised up: 1. Why these groups, what is the reason i.e. background to distinguish five substrates, where are overlappings? (1 and 2?) 2. Describe and summarize the scientific progress made during the last 10 years 3. Describe the way from science to practice: which substrates are well accepted and used which not and why In addition, I suggest giving a statement on the two questions: 1. are environmental acts limiting factors to produce and use technogenic substrates? 2. what's about plastic and the acceptance of these substrates in the last years? Finally, I suggest modifying the title to 'Using constructed soils for green infrastructure - challenges and limitations'

Your work could be very helpful to describe the next research steps and strategies to accept these substrates. Good luck!

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-85, 2019.