SOIL Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-69-RC2, 2020

Interactive comment on "Efficient Eco-Friendly Organic Wastes Mixed with Growth Promoting Bacteria to Remediate and Increase Fertility of Saline Sodic Soil in Egypt" *by* Mohamed Hafez et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 16 January 2020

The manuscript "Efficient Eco-Friendly Organic Wastes Mixed with Growth Promoting Bacteria to Remediate and Increase Fertility of Saline Sodic Soil in Egypt" prsented by M. Hafeza et al. deals with the reclamation of saline-sodic soil in arid regions of Egypt. The manuscript presents an experimental comparison among 8 types of treatments incuding the application of spent grain, compost, Azospirillum brasilense and various other mixtures of those matrices.

The manuscript presents several small and medium English mistakes, various grammar errors, etc. It needs thorough revision and rephrasing process before re-submitting

it again. Various small typographic or orthographic errors occur in the tables.

On the scientific aspects: the manuscript presents the effcts of several treatments (soil amendments) on the sodicity/salinity of the selected soils. It is rather difficult to evaluate the effects of so many treatments using different amounts of the individual amendments, and resulting in differing effects related to the various parameters.

The treatments are compared with solid or dotted lines as they were directly connected with time but there is non real connection among them. Each parameter variability should be related only to the effect of the treatment on the parameter itself. Comparing the variability of pH derived from 8 different treatments (with different chemical composizion, element content, C content, etc.) does not have any specific significance.

All of the treament produce indipendent results which cannot be connected with lines and discussed accordingly.

i believe there is a serious scientific weakness behind the experiment and the manuscript should be completely revised before re-submitting it.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-69, 2019.