

Interactive comment on “Efficient Eco-Friendly Organic Wastes Mixed with Growth Promoting Bacteria to Remediate and Increase Fertility of Saline Sodic Soil in Egypt” by Mohamed Hafez et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 14 January 2020

Authors present results of the experiment with Azospirillum inoculation with eco-friendly organic wastes for remediation of saline-sodic soils. The overall study is interesting but the paper contains a lot of mistakes and shortcomings and is written in poor English thus major revision is necessary before considering for publication in SOIL. First, the text requires proofreading otherwise some sentences are hard to understand, too long and not clear see lines 60-61, 85-89, 94-96 e.t.c. Brackets are abused by the Authors e.g. line 198-199: The total...were measured using (Anderson et al., 1982). The correct form is "The total...were measured using "name of the method used" (Ander-

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



son et al., 1982) or lines:199-201 "Micronutrients....as explained by (Soltanpour and Schwab, 1977)" - bracket is redundant, e.t.c. In the Material and methods I suggest to add more detailed information about methods used in the analysis -e.g. CEC, CaCO₃, DOC, texture of the soil used in the experiment. In the chapter 2.2 Authors suggest that procedures used in characteristic the treatments are presented in Table 2 (line 158-160) - that is not true. Table 2 presents only parameters, not procedures. The headline "Soil parameter" should be replaced by "Parameter" In the paper Authors use sometimes C/N sometimes C:N, it should be unified. The chapter "Soil physicochemical analyses" should be rewritten to "Soil physicochemical and chemical analyses". Soil organic carbon concentration is not a parameter belonging to the biological methods - it should be moved to the chapter above. In the experiment compost produced from plant and animal wastes was used - information should be supplemented with compost production technology. Line 237 "statistically significantly" should be replaced by "significantly" - similarly in many other sentences Units like cmol kg⁻¹ should be written in lowercase -see Table 3 and more. Figure 1 is redundant. Figures 2-10 : the data in the figures are not presented correctly. Authors used line charts which are reserved for presenting data changes over time, while on the figures the differences between treatments are shown. In Figure Y axis is not described. In the chapter 3.2.2 (lines 382...) Authors used "soil organic carbon while on the figure 8 "total organic carbon" is used. The correct form should be TOC, especially in the context of compost application. In the paper there is not clearly explained what is "Initial" treatment thus it is hard to understand why this object was placed in the tables. Authors should revised the paper, starting with technical side ending with proofreading.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-69>, 2019.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

