

Interactive comment on “Efficient Eco-Friendly Organic Wastes Mixed with Growth Promoting Bacteria to Remediate and Increase Fertility of Saline Sodic Soil in Egypt” by Mohamed Hafez et al.

Mohamed Hafez et al.

mhafez290@yahoo.com

Received and published: 29 January 2020

Dear reviewer#1, we would like to thank you and the anonymous reviewer for the valuable suggestions which helped us to greatly improve our work. We have followed each one of the suggestions and the detailed responses and changes made to the original manuscript are given below and included in the new manuscript. If additional modifications are required, please let us know.

C1) First, the text requires proofreading otherwise some sentences are hard to under-

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



stand, too long and not clear see lines 60-61, 85-89 , 94-96 e.t.c.

#Response: Done, lines 60-61, 85-89, 94-96 all of these lines Language checking and proofreading It's already done as suggested. thank you

C2) lines 198-199: The total...were measured using (Anderson et al., 1982). The correct form is "The total...were measured using "name of the method used" (Anderson et al., 1982) or lines:199-201 "Micronutrients....as explained by (Soltanpour and Schwab, 1977)" - bracket is redundant, e.t.c.

#Response: OK, arranged as suggested, The name of the methods used have been added and explained. The brackets were removed.

C3)-In the Material and methods I suggest to add more detailed information about methods used in the analysis -e.g. CEC, CaCO₃, DOC, the texture of the soil used in the experiment.

#Response: Agree and added more detailed information about CEC, CaCO₃, DOC, the texture of the soil used in the experiment.

C4)-In the chapter 2.2 Authors suggest that procedures used in characteristic the treatments are presented in Table 2 (line 158-160) - that is not true. Table 2 presents only parameters, not procedures.

#Response: We mean that the characteristics in the table were measured by procedures known in the analysis of the organic matter, but we improved this sentence.

C5)-The headline "Soil parameter" should be replaced by "Parameter" In the paper Authors use sometimes C/N sometimes C:N, it should be unified. The chapter "Soil physicochemical analyses"should be rewritten to "Soil physicochemical and chemical analyses". Soil organic carbon concentration is not a parameter belonging to the biological methods it should be moved to the chapter above.

#Response: OK, arranged as suggested.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



C6)- In the experiment compost produced from plant and animal wastes was used - information should be supplemented with compost production technology.

#Response: This was an omission on our part. We have added a description of compost production technology, thank you.

C7)-Line 237 "statistically significantly" should be replaced by "significantly" - similarly in many other sentences Units like cmol kg-1 should be written in lowercase -see Table 3 and more.

#Response: this correct, corrections have been added. thank you

C8)-Figure 1 is redundant. Figures 2-10 : the data in the figures are not presented correctly. Authors used line charts which are reserved for presenting data changes over time, while on the figures the differences between treatments are shown.

#Response: we think this figure is very important because it describes the temperature of the area under study, however, if you think it is not necessary we will delete it. Ok, we will delete this line charts, but it shows the effect of the transactions, especially in the pH and macro and micro-nutrients.

C9-) In chapter 3.2.2 (lines 382...) Authors used "soil organic carbon while on figure 8 "total organic carbon" is used. The correct form should be TOC, especially in the context of compost application.

#Response: Ok, this is correct, but it was figure No. 7, not No. 8, this was an omission on our part and corrected in figure No.7.

C10)-In the paper there is not clearly explained what is "Initial" treatment thus it is hard to understand why this object was placed in the tables.

#Response: This word " Initial" indicates the soil before any additions (under field condition) without treatments and it describes the natural condition of the soil before any transactions, under each table, we will explain what the word means.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Thank you for your time and effort to review our paper.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-69>, 2019.

SOILD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

