SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-65-RC1, 2019 © Author(s) 2019. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Interactive comment on "A new model for intraand inter-institutional soil data sharing" by José Padarian and Alex B. McBratney

Dominique Arrouays (Referee)

dominique.arrouays@orleans.inra.fr

Received and published: 10 October 2019

This is a nice and timely short paper. Indeed data privacy is a big issue for global science (and expecially for soil for which legal constraints may apply) and the solution proposed here might interest readers of SOIL.

I have only a few minor suggestions of technical corrections, and one for discussion

Page 4 line 17 (ref) the reference is missing

Page 6 Snippet 1; I'm not sure this example is useful if you don't detail more in depth the content. Either skipp it of be more comprehensive.

Page 6 line 11. This election process might be difficult to establish (I mean the rules).

C1

Is it based on individuals, is it proportional to the data you provide as input? to the number of times you provide new data? This might not be simple and lead to endless discussions. I think you should discuss this. Who establishes the rules? How is the consortium formed. etc. As it stands it seems very simple, but may be it is a bit naive to think that it will work smoothly without a lot of prior negociations?

Cites and references You cite and ref Rossel. it should be Viscarra Rossel (name) and R. (for Raphael) the initial.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-65, 2019.