

Interactive comment on “Changes in soil properties in a low-quality broadleaf mixed forest after cutting strip reforms in a 9-year period in Northeastern China” by Huiwen Guan et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 4 July 2019

In their manuscript the authors describe a study in which they examined the effects of clear-cutting over time on a variety of soil physical and soil chemical factors. In itself this topic of research is relevant and interesting if it is focused on unraveling underlying mechanism / processes responsible for the observed effects. In other words, hypothesis driven research aimed at gaining a fundamental understanding of generic processes. Unfortunately, I must conclude that the current study was not setup in such a manner. Instead, it is a purely descriptive work that presents a lot of measurement data and looks at trends, but makes hardly any effort to understand those trends. This makes the study of limited scientific value.

C1

In addition, the results are presented in a poor and sloppy manner. There are many mistakes in the English, but also in the general layout, font size, etc. that give the feeling that presentation did not get the attention that one can expect be given to a serious submission to a scientific journal. Also the presentation of the data in endless tables rather than informative graphs is below par.

All together, I see no alternative than to recommend rejection of this manuscript for publication in SOIL.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2019-10>, 2019.

C2