SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2018-42-RC1, 2019 © Author(s) 2019. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Error propagation in spectrometric functions of soil organic carbon" by Monja Ellinger et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 28 February 2019

Review manuscript EGU SOIL; Error propagation in spectrometric functions of soil organic carbon The aim of the study was to evaluate visible and near infrared (VIS-NIR) reflectance spectroscopy to predict SOC and particularly the source of errors associated. The error propagation when assessing SOC with VIS-NIR has been overlooked in previous studies using that technique. This study is relevant because the precise monitoring of SOC with conventional methods is labour intensive and expensive. In my opinion: - The study is original and in line with EGU SOIL topics. - The manuscript is well organized and has a good study design. - This study is a sufficient contribution to knowledge to be worth publishing in EGU SOIL. - All the sections of the MS are complete, well written and interesting to read (the manuscript has apparently passed through a round of peer-reviewing).

C1

However, VIS-NIR model building process and its associated calculation of uncertainty is not directly in my line of expertise. I recommend to find other peer reviewers. Specific comment: Lines 293-294 "... Fehler! Verweisquelle ... warden" this entence should be delete or translated in English. I have no other specific comment.

Please also note the supplement to this comment: https://www.soil-discuss.net/soil-2018-42/soil-2018-42-RC1-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2018-42, 2019.