

Interactive comment on “Aluminium and base cation chemistry in dynamic acidification models – need for a reappraisal?” by Jon Petter Gustafsson et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 3 August 2018

This relatively short paper makes a case for replacing cation exchange modelling by organic complexation modelling in dynamic acidification models. They shortly describe the two approaches and then make their case by comparing the output of four different model systems. This is done well (although sometimes very concise), except the description (equations) of the models, which in two cases are quite deficient (for details see below); but that should not be too difficult to fix. Overall, I consider the paper suitable for publication, after the authors have also taken into consideration the (sometimes minor) remarks/corrections listed below.

Technical comments and corrections are provided in the attached pdf.

C1

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.soil-discuss.net/soil-2018-19/soil-2018-19-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2018-19>, 2018.

C2