

Interactive comment on “Water in the Critical Zone: Soil, Water and Life from Profile to Planet” by M. J. Kirkby

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 23 October 2016

In view of Mike Kirkby's five decades of leadership in hillslope hydrology and critical zone science (well before the term even existed), he has clearly earned the right to have his say on this subject. This wide-ranging review and synthesis will provide a useful introduction to the topic, particularly for graduate students and those new to the field, but experts of long standing will also find food for thought. In my reading through the manuscript there were many places where I said to myself, "but what about...?", only to find that the manuscript addressed exactly that point in the next paragraph or the next page.

Another reviewer has pointed out that some of the points addressed here are also found in textbooks these days. But I see this manuscript not as a research paper, but a broad, "high-altitude" view of the subject, and in that context these points have their place. I concur with many of the points raised by Gerard Govers, and commend them

C1

to the author for his consideration. I would suggest that the manuscript be published without further review, after the author makes any changes that he sees fit in response to the comments received.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2016-50, 2016.

C2