

Interactive comment on “Water in the Critical Zone: Soil, Water and Life from Profile to Planet” **by M. J. Kirkby**

M.J. Kirkby

m.j.kirkby@leeds.ac.uk

Received and published: 23 November 2016

Summary of responses to referees – to be read with tracked changes revision of ms.(attached)

Referee 1: I have addressed almost all of the points raised. I have taken 2 paragraphs out of sections 1-3, but am reluctant to remove more, as that sets the flavour of the whole piece. I have reworked the section around figure 6 and near line 550 (see under referee 2 below) Added references are Ali et al 2013 Critchley et al 1991 Jacobson et al, 2000 Steffen et al, 2015.

Referee 2 (Govers): I have adopted all suggestions. The most substantial change is in re-shaping the discussion around line 550. Text has been modified to reflect yields and relevance of poor agronomic practice, and figure 6 (and its caption) has been replaced.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



A number of additional references have also been included, namely: Attal et al, 2015 Barthold & Woods, 2015 Davidson, 2009 Dere et al, 2010 Herold et al, 2014 Janzen & McDonnell, 2015 Johnson et al, 2014 Kirchner et al, 2000 Knapen et al, 2007 Larsen et al, 2012 Sadras et al, 2011 Stauffer & Aharony, 1985 Vitousek et al, 2016

Referee 3: No specific corrections

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.soil-discuss.net/soil-2016-50/soil-2016-50-AC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2016-50, 2016.

SOILD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

