SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2016-2-RC2, 2016 © Author(s) 2016. CC-BY 3.0 License.



SOILD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Facing policy challenges with inter- and transdisciplinary soil research focused on the SDG's" by Johan Bouma and Luca Montanarella

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 4 March 2016

This is a strong paper discussing and promoting inter- and transdisciplinary collaborations between soil scientists, other disciplines, and society in general.

Line 57 – By the mid to late 1990s I and pretty much everyone I knew were avid users of the internet. I would put the establishment of the internet at something more like 20 years ago, as opposed to 15. Hilbert and López (2011) support the \sim 20 year time period.

Lines 63-64 "...stakeholders have become..."

Line 65 – The statement about the number of young Dutch farmers who have a BSc or MSc degree needs a reference.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Line 107 - "...established in the literature."

Line 139 – "...different in the future..."

Line 142 – Hilbert and López (2011) would also be a good reference for the idea the internet was in rudimentary form in 1991.

Line 153 – In't Veld should be 2010, not 2011.

Line 167 - "...role of IPCC gained..."

Lines 181-182 "...established and had been operating for three..."

Lines 186-205 – Adding one or more case studies to this manuscript that are not based on the work of the Bouma research group would help to strengthen the idea that this topic is important to people beyond the Bouma group. For example, another good case study would be that of Tabor et al. (2011), who used soil maps (among other tools) in a landscape-epidemiological study. Excellent example of transdisciplinary work that includes SDG 3.

There are 25 references in this manuscript, 12 of which were authored or co-authored by Bouma. Dr. Bouma has done excellent work, but the case that this is an important topic for soil science as a whole as well as allied fields and society would be strengthened if additional references (and case studies, as noted above) could be brought in to demonstrate a bit broader interest and activity within the soil science and related communities.

References Hilbert, M., López, P. The world's technological capacity to store, communicate, and compute information. Science 332, 60-65. 2011.

Tabor, J.A., O'Rourke, M.K., Lebowitz, M.D., Harris, R.B. Landscape-epidemiological study design to investigate an environmentally based disease. Journal of Exposure Science and Environmental Epidemiology 21, 197-211. 2011.

SOILD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2016-2, 2016.

SOILD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

