<u>Supplement</u>

<u>Appendix A</u>

Table 1. Categories of effectiveness (Sutherland et al, 2015).

| Category | Description | General criteria | Thresholds |
|--|---|--|--|
| Beneficial | Effectiveness has been demonstrated by clear evidence. Expectation of harms is small compared with the benefits | High median benefit score High median certainty score Low median harm score | Effectiveness: >60% Certainty: >60% Harm: <20% |
| Likely to be beneficial | Effectiveness is less well established than for those listed under 'effective' OR There is clear evidence of medium effectiveness | High benefit score Lower certainty score Low harm score OR Medium benefit score High certainty score Low harm score | Effectiveness: >60% Certainty: 40-60% Harm: <20% OR Effectiveness: 40-60% Certainty: ≥40% Harm: < 20% |
| Trade-off between benefit and harms | Interventions for which practitioners must weigh up the beneficial and harmful effects according to individual circumstances and priorities | Medium benefit and medium harm scores OR High benefit and high harm scores High certainty score | Effectiveness: ≥40% Certainty: ≥40% Harm: ≥20% |
| Unknown effectiveness (limited evidence) | Currently insufficient data, or data of inadequate quality | Low certainty score | Effectiveness: Any Certainty: <40% Harm: Any |
| Unlikely to be beneficial | Lack of effectiveness is less well established than for those listed under 'likely to be ineffective or harmful' | Low benefit score Medium certainty score and/or some variation between experts | Effectiveness: <40% Certainty: 40-60% Harm: <20% |
| Likely to be ineffective or harmful | Ineffectiveness or harmfulness has been demonstrated by clear evidence | Low benefit score High certainty score (regardless of harms) OR Low benefit score High harm score (regardless of certainty of effectiveness) | Effectiveness: <40% Certainty: >60% Harm: Any OR Effectiveness: <40% Certainty: ≥40% Harm: ≥20% |

Plot data

Figure 01

| | Mixed | Cover | Crop |
|----------------------|------------|-------|----------|
| | amendments | crop | rotation |
| Number of soil types | 5 | 6 | 8 |
| Number of locations | 3 | 7 | 5 |
| Number of studies | 11 | 12 | 14 |

R script:

read.table(file="barplot.txt",header=T)->coverage attach(coverage) names(coverage) barplot(as.matrix(coverage),beside=T, ylim=c(0,18),xaxt="n ",ylab="Coverage of evidence", xlab="Actions beneficial to soil fertility") axis(1,at=c(2.5,6.5,10.5),labels=c("Mixed amendments","Cover crops","Crop rotation")) legend(6.87,18,c("Number of soil types","Number of locations","Number of studies"),fill=grey.colors(3))

Figure 02

_

| Effectiveness | Certainty | Negative side-effects |
|---------------|-----------|-----------------------|
| 69 | 64 | 15 |
| 75 | 67 | 16 |
| 66 | 75 | 8 |
| 65 | 54 | 19 |
| 64 | 46 | 19 |
| 55 | 62 | 18 |
| 51 | 58 | 14 |
| 61 | 72 | 46 |
| 55 | 52 | 64 |
| 70 | 59 | 26 |
| 60 | 64 | 23 |
| 63 | 54 | 29 |
| 53 | 59 | 32 |
| 45 | 44 | 54 |
| 53 | 53 | 34 |
| 46 | 45 | 36 |
| 49 | 45 | 20 |
| 46 | 38 | 33 |
| 58 | 35 | 20 |
| 50 | 33 | 24 |
| 53 | 36 | 16 |
| 54 | 29 | 19 |
| 35 | 37 | 23 |

| 40 | 31 | 17 |
|----|----|----|
| 36 | 23 | 19 |
| 14 | 34 | 20 |
| 26 | 40 | 48 |
| | | |

R script:

read.table(file="added.var.txt",header=T)->coverage attach(coverage) names(coverage) spcor((coverage),method=c("spearman")) install.packages("car") library(car) mod1<-lm(eff~cert+neg,data=mydataframe) avPlot(mod1,cert,neg,main="",xlab="Certainty | Negative sideeffects",ylab="Effectivness | Negative side-effects",grid=T)