

Interactive comment on “Calculating the sediment budget of a tropical lake in the Blue Nile basin: Lake Tana” by F. A. Zimale et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 9 May 2016

The present manuscript on studying sediment budget in the Lake Tana Watershed in Ethiopia was reviewed. The topic is attractive but does not fit to the context well. To me, the manuscript suffers from many deficiencies which discourage me to accept it. There was no comprehensive reviewing of literatures. No justification has been given on the necessity of the work while at least 5 very good paper written by Setegn et al. for the same area. The entire manuscript is very sparse and not connected to each others well. The study is mainly based on models which either need very complicated inputs or very sophisticated to be conceptualized for the study area. The rates given for soil erosion and sediment yield seem to me abnormal and even not corresponded with the data resulted from bathymetric studies. In overall, the present manuscript looks a general report which does not deserve publication in a scientific journal. I hope my comments and suggestions would help authors in their future works. Best Wishes

C1

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
<http://www.soil-discuss.net/soil-2015-84/soil-2015-84-RC2-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2015-84, 2016.

C2