SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2015-80-RC2, 2016 © Author(s) 2016. CC-BY 3.0 License.



SOILD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Soil archives of a Fluvisol: subsurface analysis and soil history of the medieval city centre of Vlaardingen, the Netherlands – an integral approach" by S. J. Kluiving et al.

P. Sinclair (Referee)

paul.sinclair@arkeologi.uu.se

Received and published: 8 March 2016

I find this contribution to be a very good example of multidisciplinary analysis of urban stratigraphy. It presents a coherant Array of geoscience technical analyses within a very interesting archaeological context. The research questions are clearly formulated and the analyses are well focussed as might be expected of the authors concerned. The results are clear and not insignificant.

Recently we have seen the development of Micro stratigraphic analysis in urban sites. This is often carried out without sufficient focus upon the broader contextual stratig-

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



raphy. This paper provides a very clear example of the value of straightforward multi-scalar multi-proxy analysis (76 mechanical drill holes, grain size analysis (GSA), thermo-gravimetric analysis (TGA), archaeological remains, soil analysis, dating methods, micromorphology, and microfauna demonstrating or at least arguing very strongly the complexity of human environmental interactions. The methodological approach testing the deposits prior to and after the flooding events provide reassuring diachronic detail. On reviewing the location of the boreholes it does not appear given the somewhat restricted access to drill locations, that any random stratified approach was used. However the number and spread of drill holes does support the assumption of representativity of the samples analysed.

The tables are informative and well sructured. The AMS dates are well grouped adding support to the overall argument of the paper. The illustrations also are well chosen and clear but perhaps the core sratigraphy diagrammes figs 5 a etc will not stand much reduction though this might well not be an issue in a digital publication. Its good though that they are in colour.

Overall this paper presents an excellent example of integrated approaches to complex human environmental urban contexts and I would like to see this approach applied more widely. SOILD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., doi:10.5194/soil-2015-80, 2016.