SOIL Discuss., 2, C84-C85, 2015 www.soil-discuss.net/2/C84/2015/ © Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Are biodiversity indices of spontaneous grass covers in olive orchards good indicators of soil degradation?" by E. V. Taguas et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 20 April 2015

The paper is strongly weakned by the choice of the biodiversity indicators, because species richness (R) is a very generic indicator giving no information about the quality of the species, Shannon (H) index gives an absolut value mirroring how a sum is partitioned among it's addenda and Pielou's Index (J, also known as Evenness) is the expression of H in relative form, so that H and J are more or less the same thing. Soerensen index has been used for evaluating the similarity between the catchments in different seasons, but such evaluation is not very linked to the aims of the paper. The paper should have been focused on life-forms, but they have been quite neglected. The starting hypothesis based on the amplitude of ecological niche should have been in-

C84

vesigated on the basis of the evaluation of life-forms (diversity, frequency,...), because it is more likely that the life-forms respond to niche constraints rather than the species number.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 233, 2015.