

## ***Interactive comment on “Soil properties and not inputs control carbon, nitrogen, phosphorus ratios in cropped soils in the long-term” by E. Frossard et al.***

**E. Frossard et al.**

emmanuel.frossard@usys.ethz.ch

Received and published: 2 December 2015

To Christian Feller: Many thanks for your positive feedback. We will correct the points you spotted thanks for that as well.

To P Ngo: Many thanks for your positive feedback. 1. We will insert “bio-Dynamic, bio-Organic, Konventionell” at the indicated place. 2. We will make a choice between Fig. and Figure and be consistent. 3. Can the CNP ratios be used as an indicator of soil quality/fertility? We do not think so, but we prefer not to discuss it because of our very low number of soils. The figure 4a shows that the CN ratios (the slope of the curves) are very similar in the three soils despite their very different soil properties. Besides

C627

the Figure 4b shows very different N to Po ratios with the lowest slope observed in the most clayey soil, the intermediate in the sandy soil and the highest in the loamy soil, i.e. showing trends that are not consistent. We conclude from these observations that CN and NPo ratio are not related to soil properties and therefore not related to soil fertility. However we had only 3 soils and we cannot draw conclusions on such a small number of soils. We therefore prefer not to discuss this point in the paper.

---

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 995, 2015.