

Interactive comment on "Soil properties and not inputs control carbon, nitrogen, phosphorus ratios in cropped soils in the long-term" by E. Frossard et al.

P. Ngo (Referee)

ngophuongchimie@gmail.com

Received and published: 12 November 2015

This paper is very interesting, rich in information and well-constructed. I only have some detailed comments:

1. P996-L10: Please explain a bit about "DOK experiment" (may be just insert "bio-Dynamic, bio-Organic, Konventionell" beside DOK) as you made for Saria and Wagga Wagga in the same sentence.

- 2. Please make a choice "Fig." or "Figure" (P1005-L25, P2015-L1,4&6...)
- 3. The authors have clearly explained the important of study CNP ratio to understand C584

the functioning of cropped soil in long-term and found a relationship between CNP ratio and soil properties. Thus, I wonder if we can use the CNP ratio as an indicator of the soil quality or fertility? If we know about this ratio of a soil, could we make any comment about this soil properties?

Kind regards,

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 995, 2015.