

Interactive comment on “Potential effects of vinasse as a soil amendment to control runoff and soil loss” by Z. Hazbavi and S. H. R. Sadeghi

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 7 September 2015

Dear Authors,

Although the present work presents an interesting approach, I would suggest MAJOR REVISIONS before considering it for publishing. There are several scientific and presentation lacks that the authors should change before reconsidering for publication. Also there is a high need of bibliography that should be taken into account. I quite not see/understand the point/aim of this work as it you do not discuss your results but the results from Tejada and González.

I would encourage the authors to send the manuscript to an English-native speaker as it is difficult to follow the ideas as it is now.

ABSTRACT

C438

Line 5 I would suggest to give a brief description of 'vinasse' (just a few words) Line 8 Revise the units (intensities are in mm!!!) Line 15 So the main result is that vinasse could not decrease runoff and soil loss????

INTRODUCTION

Line 20 Please change to 'about 150 M US dollars' Line 24-25 References needed Line 5-6 Which literature review? When was it done? Where are the citations? Line 11 The aims of the work are highly missing

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Line 15 We need more detail on how the simulations were performed and type of rainfall simulator Line 8-14 The levels were selected before or after? It is not clear. Line 18 I would suggest some numbers on the IDF (Intensity–duration–frequency) curves Line 24 Please, revise the English

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 1) RUNOFF

Line 21 If the effect of vinasse on runoff was not significant...what was then the aim of the work? Line 27-8 But have you measured what you state in the paragraph? Line 15-17 Please explain why Line 20 You need to explain this

2) SOIL LOSS Line 22 You need to show values here. It is in the RESULTS AND DISCUSSION SECTION where you have to show and explain your data so the rest of the scientific community can understand your work. Line 9-20 And what about your results? You explain other researchers work but not yours.

TABLES

Please check the format (same number of decimals, font)

FIGURES

Please provide a new version of figure 1 as it needs more resolution Please present all

C439

the figure with the same format and not a 'copy-paste' version of them

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 767, 2015.

C440