

Interactive comment on “Study of microarthropod communities to assess soil quality in different managed vineyards” by E. Gagnarli et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 10 March 2015

This paper constitutes an interesting work concerning the effects of agricultural practices on soil fauna. However methodologies used and described are not at the required scientific level to be published in the current state. Furthermore the introduction and discussions are weak. This study seems to be only a study case. What generic information this study gives to the scientific community, which has not been published before?

Abstract Line 19 : you mention a multidisciplinary approach, which is not the case here.
Line 24: you did not identify species, so you can speak about species richness
Line 29: what is a preserved soil? For what?

Introduction Your introduction is too fuzzy and general, with trivial information. I would

C28

really have some information on the studied systems and the context of the study. What about vineyard soils? Very few studies have been published on the topic (microarthropods in vineyards), but some data exists (for instance Renaud et al 2004, Pedobiologia, for instance). What are the particular problems specific to vineyards? No precise information is given concerning organic matter. Line 31: you mention food-webs. How do you assess them?

Material and methods Line 10: What means IPM? Lines 13 and 17: How many samples did you collect? Line 6 and 7: species were not identified Table 1: what are the differences between sites 1, 2 and 3. Describe the plots please. How many samples and subsamples?... Table 2: please give at least standard errors of your means; Did you test the accuracy using ANOVA?

Results I cannot appreciate the consistency of the results because the methods are used are not well described. Table 3: no statistics shown in the results. Line 28: you describe physico-chemical parameters in the chapter soil microarthropods abundance

Discussion trivial

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 67, 2015.

C29