

Interactive comment on “Effects of fresh and aged biochars from pyrolysis and hydrothermal carbonization on nutrient sorption in agricultural soils” by M. Gronwald et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 9 February 2015

The manuscript deals with the effects of freshed and aged biochars from pyrolysis and hydrothermal carbonization on nutrient sorption in agricultural soils. The topic of the manuscript could be of interest to the readers. It certainly falls in the SOILD. However, many parts of manuscript need to be rewritten, some disputable sentences need to be improved. Therefore, I recommend it for publication after major revisions.

-Please be consistent with some terms like pyrochar, hydrochar, biochar and charcoal. If the authors would like to focus on pyrochar and hydrochar, please use just those terms. -Page 33, from line 21; please define DOC since it is the first time to be used. Page 37: How was CEC measured? Page 39: Statistical analysis is not complete.

C12

It is only focused on adsorption processes. Page 40: Please give some explanation about Hydro200, Hydro250,...The reader needs to be reminded here about those treatments. Page 42, line 26: Is 8-2 % correct??? The results section particularly sorption of phosphorous is very difficult to be understood. It needs to be rewritten. Reference list needs to be edited.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 2, 29, 2015.

C13