SOIL Discuss., 2, 701–736, 2015 www.soil-discuss.net/2/701/2015/ doi:10.5194/soild-2-701-2015 © Author(s) 2015. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal SOIL. Please refer to the corresponding final paper in SOIL if available.

Tree species identity and functional traits but not species richness affect interrill erosion processes in young subtropical forests

S. Seitz¹, P. Goebes¹, Z. Song¹, H. Bruelheide^{2,3}, W. Härdtle⁴, P. Kühn¹, Y. Li⁴, and T. Scholten¹

¹Department of Geosciences, Soil Science and Geomorphology, Eberhard Karls University Tübingen, Rümelinstrasse 19–23, 72070 Tübingen, Germany

²Geobotany and Botanical Garden, Martin Luther University Halle-Wittenberg, Am Kirchtor 1, 06108 Halle, Germany

³German Centre for Integrative Biodiversity Research (iDIV) Halle-Jena-Leipzig,

Deutscher Platz 5e, 04103 Leipzig, Germany

⁴Institute of Ecology, Faculty of Sustainability, Leuphana University Lüneburg, Scharnhorststrasse 1, 21335 Lüneburg, Germany

| | SO 2, 701–7 | ILD 36, 2015 | | | | | | |
|-------------|---|------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | Tree diversity and interrill erosion processes S. Seitz et al. | | | | | | | |
| | Title | Page | | | | | | |
| 5 | Abstract | Introduction | | | | | | |
| - | Conclusions | References | | | | | | |
| | Tables | Figures | | | | | | |
|)) 5 | ◄ | ▶1 | | | | | | |
| 5 | • | • | | | | | | |
| 5 | Back | Close | | | | | | |
| - | Full Scre | een / Esc | | | | | | |
| | Printer-frier | ndly Version | | | | | | |
| 5 | Interactive | Discussion | | | | | | |
|))) | œ | ву | | | | | | |

Received: 13 May 2015 – Accepted: 11 June 2015 – Published: 24 June 2015

Correspondence to: S. Seitz (steffen.seitz@uni-tuebingen.de)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.



Abstract

Soil erosion is seriously threatening ecosystem functioning in many parts of the world. In this context, it is assumed that tree species richness and functional diversity of tree communities can play a critical role in improving ecosystem services such as erosion

- ⁵ control. An experiment with 170 micro-scale runoff plots was conducted to investigate the influence of tree species richness and identity as well as tree functional traits on interrill erosion in a young forest ecosystem. An interrill erosion rate of 47.5 t ha⁻¹ a⁻¹ was calculated. This study provided evidence that different tree species affect interrill erosion, but higher tree species richness did not mitigate soil losses in young forest
- stands. Thus, different tree morphologies have to be considered, when assessing erosion under forest. High crown cover and leaf area index reduced soil losses in initial forest ecosystems, whereas rising tree height increased them. Even if a leaf litter cover was not present, remaining soil surface cover by stones and biological soil crusts was the most important driver for soil erosion control. Furthermore, soil organic matter had
- ¹⁵ a decreasing influence on soil loss. Long-term monitoring of soil erosion under closing tree canopies is necessary and a wide range of functional tree traits should be taken into consideration in future research.

1 Introduction

Soil erosion is seriously threatening natural and agricultural ecosystems in many parts

of the world. Therefore, it is considered as one of the most severe environmental challenges (Morgan, 2005). Pimentel and Kounang (1998) stated that about 75 billion tons of soil are eroded at global scale every year and soil is lost 13–40 times faster than it can regenerate. Soil erosion is also a serious challenge in the PR China, especially in the southern tropical and subtropical zone. Within this region, the annual soil loss
 rate ranges between 0.28 and 113 tha⁻¹, depending on the annual precipitation, the landscape and the land use (Guo et al., 2015). Besides negative on-site effects like de-



clining soil fertility, off-site effects triggered by the transport of sediment and included nutrients as well as pollutants cause high mitigation efforts and costs (Pimentel et al., 1995; Richter, 1998) and affect nutrient cycling and ecosystem functioning (Baumann et al., 2009; Zhao et al., 2009).

- Moreover, soil erosion can negatively influence biodiversity (Pimentel and Kounang, 1998), but it is assumed that this relationship also acts vice versa (Körner and Spehn, 2002; Geißler et al., 2012b; Brevik et al., 2015). It has been shown that a change in diversity can have remarkable effects on ecosystem functions and stability (e.g. Hooper et al., 2005; Scherer-Lorenzen, 2005). In many cases, increasing biodiversity antegrated approach as a productivity and stability (Lorenze, 2001; Jacob et al., 2010). In
- enhanced ecosystem productivity and stability (Loreau, 2001; Jacob et al., 2010). In particular, tree species richness as well as functional diversity of tree communities can play a critical role in improving ecosystem services such as water filtration, climate regulation or erosion control (Quijas et al., 2012; Chisholm et al., 2013; Scherer-Lorenzen, 2014). As forests are generally considered beneficial for erosion control, afforestation
- ¹⁵ is a common measure of soil protection (Romero-Diaz et al., 2010; Jiao et al., 2012). This also applies to the south-eastern part of China, which is known as a hotspot of biodiversity and woody plants (Barthlott et al., 2005; Bruelheide et al., 2011). Guo et al. (2015) showed that forests in this area experienced the lowest soil loss rates of all land use types in China. Considering that studies on soil erosion under forest
- have mostly focused on deforestation (Blanco-Canqui and Lal, 2008) and counteracting measures like afforestation generally result in monoculture stands (Puettmann et al., 2009), it appears that the role of tree species richness for soil erosion has been largely disregarded. Although positive effects of mixed-species tree stands like increasing productivity or reduced pest risks were demonstrated (e.g. Vilà et al., 2007; Bauhus and Canton and Ca
- Schmerbeck, 2010), the effects on erosion control are still unclear. Zhou et al. (2002) and Tsujimura et al. (2006) demonstrated that tree monocultures have only limited mitigation potential for soil losses, but further research is scarce. Nevertheless, there is growing evidence that higher species richness can reduce soil erosion (Körner and Spehn, 2002). Bautista et al. (2007) pointed out that an increase in functional diversity



within a perennial vegetation cover decreased soil losses in a semiarid Mediterranean landscape. Pohl et al. (2009) showed that an increase in the diversity of root types led to higher soil stability on an alpine grassy hillslope, and recently Berendse et al. (2015) found that a loss of grass species diversity reduced erosion resistance on a dike slope.

- ⁵ Conceivable mechanisms underlying positive species richness effects on soil erosion are that vegetation covers with a high number of species include a high number of plant functional groups which complement one another. Thus, they are more effective in controlling erosion processes than vegetative covers with few species (Pohl et al., 2012). For example, a high tree species richness may result in an increased stratifica-
- tion of canopy layers (Lang et al., 2010). As a consequence, crown overlap, biomass density, and total canopy cover often are higher in mixtures than in monocultures (Lang et al., 2012). In addition, a highly diverse structure within the leaf litter layer on the forest floor seems to improve its protecting effect (Martin et al., 2010). Recently, Seitz et al. (2015) pointed out that sediment discharge depends on the species identities in
- the leaf litter cover, whereas there was no effect of leaf species richness or functional diversity on soil erosion. Further research appears to be necessary on the influence of tree species richness on erosion control, but also the complex system of interacting functional groups within the vegetation cover seems to be of interest.

Vegetation covers are generally considered a key factor for the occurrence and di mension of soil erosion (Thornes, 1990; Hupp et al., 1995; Morgan, 2005). A leaf litter layer on the forest floor, for example, protects the soil from direct raindrop impact and modifies the water flow and storage capacities on the soil surface (Kim et al., 2014). Moreover, forests can provide a multi-storey canopy layer which largely influences rain throughfall patterns and leads to the capture of raindrops as well as the storage of
 water within the tree crown (Puiddefábregas, 2005). Nevertheless, large drops can be

²⁵ water within the tree crown (Puigdefábregas, 2005). Nevertheless, large drops can be formed at leaf apexes of tall trees (Geißler et al., 2012a) and thus may increase the kinetic energy of throughfall in older forest stands up to a factor of 2.6 compared to open fields (Nanko et al., 2008). This leads to considerable soil loss if the forest floor is unprotected, which may be the case if protecting layers diminish e.g. under shady con-



ditions (Onda et al., 2010) or fast decomposition (Razafindrabe et al., 2010). Whereas the effects of soil surface covers on soil erosion is well studied (Thornes, 1990; Blanco-Canqui and Lal, 2008), much less is known about the influence of species-specific functional traits of the tree layer such as crown or stem characteristics (Lavorel and

- Garnier, 2002; Guerrero-Campo et al., 2008). Moreover, most research on the latter aspects was performed in old-grown forests (e.g. Zhou et al., 2002; Nanko et al., 2008; Geißler et al., 2012a), whereas forests in an early-successional stage are rarely mentioned. In those young forests, tree heights are lower than in later stages, but structural and spatial complexity is high and species-specific growth rates differ considerably
- ¹⁰ (Swanson et al., 2011). We assume that these species-specific differences in structure and growth will influence soil erosion rates.

Our research focused on the influence of tree species richness, tree species identity, and species-specific functional traits on interrill erosion in young forests, when a leaf litter cover is not present. Testing for those effects on soil erosion requires a common

- garden situation, in which confounding factors such as different tree ages and sizes, inclination or soil conditions are closely controlled. These requirements were met in the forest biodiversity-ecosystem functioning experiment in subtropical China (BEF-China; cf. Bruelheide et al., 2014). Within this experiment, we established a high number of micro-scale runoff plots in a randomly dispersed and replicated design. Thereby, we
 addressed the following hypotheses:
 - 1. Increasing tree species richness decreases soil erosion rates.
 - 2. Tree species differ in their impact on soil erosion rates.
 - 3. The effects of different tree species on soil erosion rates can be explained by species-specific functional traits.
- First, we hypothesized that higher tree species richness leads to lower soil erosion rates. This is due to higher stratified and overlapping tree canopies, even when a leaf litter cover is not present. Second, we presumed that soil erosion rates change in rela-



tion to different tree species due to species-specific functional traits. Third, we believed that tree height and canopy characteristics are good predictors for soil erosion rates.

2 Methodology

2.1 Study site and experimental design

- ⁵ The study was conducted in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China (29°06.450' N and 117°55.450' E) at the experimental sites A and B of the BEF China project (Bruelheide et al., 2014). Together, both sites comprise an area of about 50 ha in a mountainous landscape with an elevation range from 100 m to 265 m a.s.l. Slopes range from 15 to 41°. The bedrock of the experimental site consists of non-calcareous slates with
- ¹⁰ varying sand and silt contents and is intermittent by siliceous-rich joints. Prevailing soil types are Cambisols with Anthrosols in downslope positions and Gleysols in valleys (cf. IUSS, 2006) covering saprolites. Soil bulk density is low (0.98 g cm⁻³), and soil reaction acidic (mean pH in KCl 3.68). Soil texture ranges from silt loam to silty clay loam. The climate in Xingangshan is humid and subtropical and ranked as Cwa after the Köppen-
- ¹⁵ Geiger classification. It is characterized by an annual average temperature of 17.4 °C and a mean annual rainfall of 1635 mm (Goebes et al., 2015b).

The experimental area has been used as a commercial forest plantation (*Cunning-hamia lancelota*) until 2007. It was clear-cut and replanted in 2009–2010 following an experimental plot-based design with different extinction scenarios (Bruelheide et al.,

- 20 2014). The experimental site represented an early successional stage with tree ages from four to five years at the time of our study. In total, 566 experimental plots were established using a pool of 40 native tree species, as well as bare ground and free succession plots. Trees were planted randomly in seven species richness levels (div0, 1, 2, 4, 8, 16, 24) with a planting distance of 1.29 m, following a broken stick design
- (Bruelheide et al., 2014). We focused on the Very Intensively studied Plots (VIPs) of which 34 were used in this study. The monocultures with tree heights lower than 1 m



or crown covers less than 10% were excluded from the analysis. The selected set comprised a bare ground feature $(4 \times \text{div0})$ and four levels of tree species richness $(20 \times \text{div1}, 4 \times \text{div8}, 4 \times \text{div16} \text{ and } 2 \times \text{div24})$ with a total of 22 tree species, two of which only appeared in mixtures (Appendix Table A1).

5 2.2 Erosion measurements

To determine initial sediment discharge and surface runoff, micro-scale runoff plots (ROP, 0.4 m × 0.4 m) were used (cf. Seitz et al., 2015; without fauna treatment). Each ROP was connected to a 20 L reservoir and a rainfall gauge was placed next to it (Fig. 1). All 34 VIPs were equipped with five ROPs each, resulting in a total number of 170 ROPs. Within each VIP, the ROPs were placed randomly in selected areas, which were representative for the range of surface properties of our study area. All leaf litter was removed from the ROPs prior to measurements. The ROPs were operated in May and June 2013 during the rainy season. Runoff volume and rainfall amount were determined in situ and sediment was assessed after sampling by drying at 40 °C and weighing. The capacity of the reservoirs was not exceeded in any rainfall event.

At each ROP (n = 170), tree crown cover and leaf area index (LAI) were measured using a fish-eye camera system (Nikon D100 with Nikon AF G DX 180°) and the HemiView V.8 software (Delta-T devices, Cambridge, UK). Total tree height, stem diameter at 5 cm above ground (hereafter, stem diameter) and crown width for each

- ²⁰ tree individual were measured to represent the tree characteristics (Li et al., 2014). Soil surface cover was measured photogrammetrically (grid quadrat method with GIMP 2.8) and slope with an inclinometer at each ROP (n = 170), respectively. Soil texture and soil organic matter (SOM) were identified for each VIP (5 cm depth, 9 replicates, n = 34) using a SediGraph III 5120 (Micromeritics, Aachen, Germany) and a Vario EL
- ²⁵ III elemental analyser (Elementar, Hanau, Germany). Furthermore, pH was measured in 1 M KCl using Sentix 81 electrodes.



2.3 Rainfall patterns

Weather conditions were recorded by an on-site climate station (ecoTech datalog-ger with Vaisala weather transmitter and ecoTech tipping bucket balance) in 5-min intervals. The total precipitation in the study area in 2013 was 1205 mm and lower
than the mean of the preceding three years (1635 mm). Of this amount, a fraction of 957 mm (33 events) were strong enough to trigger soil erosion following Wischmeier and Smith (1978) who used an event threshold of 12.7 mm. This threshold was confirmed by Yin et al. (2007) to be valid for southeast China. In total, 10 rainfall events were captured at the study area in May and June. Four of those events (E1–E4) can be
considered erosive. The total rainfall amount from May to June was 185 mm, of which 135 mm fell during erosive rainfall events. The mean and peak intensities as well as the total rainfall amount (except for E4) increased from May to June (Table 1), reflecting a growing monsoon influence from beginning to mid-summer.

2.4 Statistical analysis

- Linear mixed effects models with restricted maximum likelihood were performed with R 3.0.2 (R Core Team, 2013) and "ImerTest" (Kuznetsova et al., 2014) to investigate the influences on sediment discharge. Models were fitted with crown cover, leaf area index, tree height, stem diameter, crown width, slope, surface cover, SOM, amount of precipitation, and tree species richness as fixed effects. As random effects, precipi-
- tation event nested in plot, tree composition, site, and ROP nested in plot were used. Tree and crown characteristics were fitted one after the other, because they were highly correlated. Contrasts of diversity levels (div0 to div1–24, div1 to div8–24) were introduced to quantify the effects of bare plots vs. tree plantations and tree monocultures vs. mixtures, respectively. The effect of individual tree species (div1) was tested sep-
- ²⁵ arately against the mean sediment discharge using crown cover, slope, surface cover, SOM, and amount of precipitation as fixed factors and site, and ROP nested in plot as random factor (n = 200). The maximum likelihood approach was used to obtain model



simplification by step-wise backward selection, eliminating the least significant variable except for tree species richness. If multicolinearity was detected (spearman $\rho > 0.7$), co-variables were omitted. All variables were continuous and scaled, so model estimates could be compared. The data was log-transformed and the residuals did not show any deviation from normality. Hypotheses were tested with an ANOVA type 3 with Satterthwaite approximation for degrees of freedom and p-values were obtained by likelihood ratio tests.

3 Results

3.1 Species richness effects on interrill erosion processes

¹⁰ Tree species richness did not affect sediment discharge or runoff (Fig. 2 and Appendix Table A2). Sediment discharge tended to decrease from diversity level 0 to 8 and to increase to diversity level 24, while runoff volume tended to decrease from diversity level 0 to 16 and to increase to diversity level 24, but shifts were non-significant. Sediment discharge and runoff volume did not differ between bare plots (div0) and plots with trees (div1–div24), just as between monocultures (div1) and species mixtures (div8, div16, div24). The standard deviations of sediment discharge (g m⁻²) and runoff volume (L m⁻²) in relation to diversity levels were high (Fig. 2 and Appendix Table A3). Mean crown cover in mixed stands was 44 % and mean tree height was 2.30 m compared to monocultures with 22 % and 1.63 m. In our experiment tree height in mixed stands was not lower than 1.07 m and crown cover achieved at least 29 %.

3.2 Species identity effects on interrill erosion processes

Individual tree species in monocultures affected sediment discharge differently (Fig. 3). The mean sediment discharge is 199 gm⁻² across all tree monocultures, among which *Ch. axillaris*, *C. glauca*, *R. chinensis*, and *K. bipinnata* showed above average,



and *M. yuyuanensis*, *L. glaber*, *E. chinensis*, and *L. formosana* below average sediment discharge. The growth characteristics of these tree species differed considerably between the species (Table 2).

3.3 Effects of tree functional traits and site characteristics

- ⁵ Crown cover was highly correlated with LAI, tree height, stem diameter, and crown width (r = 0.82, 0.80, 0.75, 0.77, respectively). Crown cover (p < 0.01) and LAI (p < 0.05) negatively affected sediment discharge. Tree height marginally positively affected sediment discharge (p < 0.1), whereas stem diameter and crown width had no influence (Fig. 4, Appendix Table A2). The soil surface cover consisted of stones and bi-
- ¹⁰ ological soil crusts and canopied on average one fifth of the ROP surfaces in May and June 2013. It affected sediment discharge negatively (p < 0.001). Mean soil organic matter content in the top layer was high and reduced sediment discharge (p < 0.05). An indication of hydrophobic surface coatings and a significant role of water repellency could not be found. The mean slope angle did not affect sediment discharge (Fig. 4, Appendix Table A2).
 - Growth characteristics were highly variable between tree species, which was reflected by high standard deviations of the respective variables. In contrast, site characteristics of these plots showed a low variability (Table 3).

3.4 Interrill erosion in young Chinese subtropical forests

²⁰ Event-based mean sediment discharge increased with peak intensity from precipitation event 1 to event 4 with 42 g m⁻² (E1), 85 g m⁻² (E2), 120 g m⁻² (E3) and 283 g m⁻² (E4). The interrill soil erosion rate determined by micro-scale ROPs and extrapolated for erosive precipitation events (> 12.7 mm rainfall amount) was estimated to be 47.5 t ha⁻¹ in 2013.



4 Discussion

4.1 Species richness effects on interrill erosion processes

Tree species richness did not affect sediment discharge or runoff volume, and thus the first hypothesis has to be rejected. Nevertheless, a trend was visible from diver-

- sity level 0 to 8, where sediment discharge and runoff were decreasing. However, both parameters were nearly the same at diversity level 1 and 24 and standard deviations were high. Whereas tree growth patterns in monocultures were highly variable, mixed stands indicated a more balanced development (Kelty, 2006). All species mixtures in this experiment assured a minimum dimension of tree height and ground coverage af-
- ter four to five years of tree growth, whereas in monocultures the canopy cover was highly tree species specific. Thus, we needed to exclude several monoculture plots before measurements, because some species could not provide any considerable ground coverage. At the same time, sediment discharge in mixture stands was lower than in monocultures. Nevertheless, contrasts in the model could not show any statistical difference between monocultures and mixtures or bare and covered plots.

The absence of a species richness effect on soil erosion is likely attributable to the early successional stage of the forest experiment with low tree ages. Full canopy covers with high stratification and overlap have not yet been developed at the study site, and the trees did by far not reach terminal height (Goebes et al., 2015b; Li et al., 2014).

- We assume that these vegetation characteristics will change with increasing tree age and tree species richness may become evident in adult stands. Young trees are functionally more equivalent than older trees (Barnes and Spurr, 1998) and specific crown traits may emerge more distinctly in later successional stages. Geißler et al. (2013) found that the erosion potential was higher in medium and old grown forests than in
- young forests. This effect is caused by raindrop transformation processes during the canopy passage, resulting in higher throughfall kinetic energy under forest than on fallow land (Geißler et al., 2010) and has only been proved for advanced successional forest stages (Nanko et al., 2008; Geißler et al., 2013). With ongoing time of the exper-



iment and increasing tree height we expect increasing throughfall kinetic energy, which in turn increases the general soil erosion potential.

4.2 Species identity effects on interrill erosion processes

Trees in monocultures differed in their impact on soil erosion and thus hypothesis 2 can be confirmed. In a study on common European tree species, Augusto et al. (2002) showed that the tree species composition of forests has an impact on chemical, physical and biological soil properties. Several studies revealed that individual plants are important for erosion control in arid and semi-arid Mediterranean landscapes (e.g. Bochet et al., 2006; cf. Durán Zuazo and Rodríguez Pleguezuelo, 2008) and Xu et al. (2008) showed that different plant morphologies may control soil loss and improved soil properties in a dry river valley in China. In our study, four tree species (*Ch. axillaris, C. glauca, R. chinensis, K. bipinnata*) seemed to foster soil erosion rates, whereas another four species (*M. yuyuanensis, L. glaber, E. chinensis, L. formosana*) showed a mitigating effect on soil erosion at this initial stage of the forest ecosystem. Thus, we

- can confirm a species-specific effect on sediment discharge for our subtropical experimental area. Species-specific effects can result from different throughfall kinetic energy, which was recently shown by Goebes et al. (2015a) at the same study site in China. The effect of throughfall kinetic energy was ascribed to different tree architectural characteristics and leaf traits. The authors found three out of 11 tree species to have distinct
- ²⁰ differences in mean throughfall kinetic energy. *Ch. axillaris* and *S. saponaria* showed higher values, whereas *S. superba* was characterized by lower values of throughfall kinetic energy. On our experimental site, varying tree species revealed heterogeneous growth patterns, which were caused by species-specific growth variation and abiotic site conditions (Li et al., 2014). *Ch. axillaris* was the tallest tree species with a nearly
- ²⁵ closed canopy and caused the highest amount of sediment discharge in our study. Raindrops falling from leaves of this species nearly reached terminal velocity and hence throughfall kinetic energy was high (Morgan, 2005; Goebes et al., 2015a). This finding explained the high erosion rates below this fast-growing species. Further stands with



significantly higher erosion rates and the four tree species with a mitigating effect on soil erosion showed lower tree heights and thus lower throughfall kinetic energy. Their effect on sediment discharge has to be explained by further functional traits.

4.3 Effects of tree functional traits and site characteristics

- Tree species differed widely in canopy characteristics, and sediment discharge was significantly related to crown cover and LAI. Therefore, the species-specific effects of soil erosion can be partially contributed to species-specific functional traits, which confirms hypothesis 3. The falling velocities of throughfall drops are highly variable under different tree species due to the species-specific growth pattern and crown characteristics of the species of the sp
- (Goebes et al., 2015a). Frasson and Krajewski (2011) showed that the mechanisms of interception are manifold even within a single canopy and varying canopy levels create different drop size distributions. Increasing crown cover and LAI were mitigating soil erosion in this early ecosystem stage. The magnitude of canopy cover determines the proportion of raindrops intercepted (Blanco-Canqui and Lal, 2008). Anyhow, LAI
- showed a weaker significance than crown cover, probably because many trees had not yet developed a multi-layered canopy structure. As trees did not yet reach adult height (mean height < 2 m) in this study, the kinetic energy of raindrops formed at leaf tips was lower than in grown up tree stands and drops did not reach terminal velocities (Morgan, 2005; Geißler et al., 2013; Goebes et al., 2015a). Therefore, tree height had a weak
- effect on sediment discharge (p < 0.1) in our study, and sediment discharge rates under trees were not exceeding those on bare ground. Nevertheless, high sediment discharge under *Ch. axillaris*, by far the fastest growing tree in our experiment, showed the potential of high trees to increase soil erosion on uncovered forest floors. Stem diameter and crown width did not seem to influence erosion processes in early stage
- forest ecosystems. Several other tree-related functional traits (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013) could be used to explain sediment discharge such as branching architecture, specific leaf area, and root system morphology. Especially studies on leaf traits (Nanko et al., 2013) as well as belowground stratification (Gyssels et al., 2005; Stokes)



et al., 2009) showed the potential to influence soil loss and pointed out the complexity of factors mitigating soil erosion in forest ecosystems.

Our results showed that soil surface cover and soil organic matter also affect interrill erosion. Even though a leaf litter cover was not present in this experiment, the remaining soil surface cover by stones and biological soil crusts was the most important driver to reduce sediment discharge. This finding underlines the general importance of covered soil surfaces for erosion control (cf. Thornes, 1990; Morgan, 2005) and shows that the protecting effect of leaf litter could not only be replaced by soil skeleton but also by topsoil microbial communities in young forest stands. The mitigating effect

- of leaf litter on soil losses has not been in the focus of this experimental approach, but it is presumed that the fall of leaves even in young aged forests reduces soil erosion considerably compared to bare land (Blanco-Canqui and Lal, 2008; Seitz et al., 2015). Furthermore, soil organic matter effectively prevented soil erosion by binding primary particles into aggregates (Blanco-Canqui and Lal, 2008). If soil organic matter
 increases with increasing species richness, as it was recently demonstrated in a grass-land study by Cong et al. (2014), an indirect effect of biodiversity on soil erosion can
- be presumed. At last, slope angle was not affecting soil erosion due to the short plot length that limits runoff velocities (cf. Seitz et al., 2015).

4.4 Interrill erosion in young Chinese subtropical forests

- The soil loss rate determined by our micro-scale ROPs (47.5 t ha⁻¹ a⁻¹) for 2013 was considerably higher than the average rate Guo et al. (2015) recently calculated for South China (approx. 20 t ha⁻¹ a⁻¹) in a study based on small-scale and field ROPs. Pimentel (1993) reported an average rate of 36 t ha⁻¹ a⁻¹ for the same area. Zheng et al. (2007) stated an average soil loss rate of 31 t ha⁻¹ a⁻¹ determined with ¹³⁷Cs / ²¹⁰Pb
 tracing techniques in Sichuan Province, PR China. These different rates are due to
- different land use types and measurement techniques, but also to the scale-dependent nature of soil erosion and runoff generation (cf. Boix-Fayos et al., 2006; Cantón et al., 2011). In an event-based approach, Zhu and Zhu (2014) pointed out that ROPs with



short slope length yield higher sediment discharge than those with longer slope length and Bagarello and Ferro (2004) showed that increasing the size of ROPs from 0.04 to 0.16 m² decreased runoff and sediment discharge by a factor of 2.6. The micro-scale ROPs used in our study (0.16 m²) quantified interrill wash and sediment detachment by raindrop impact (cf. Agassi and Bradford, 1999). However, an important part of erosion 5 appears in the rilling system, and the influence of interrill processes on soil erosion varies greatly (Govers and Poesen, 1988). Sediment discharge and runoff change with ROP length (cf. Abrahams et al., 1995) and boundary effects increasingly influence the results with decreasing plot sizes (Mutchler et al., 1994). Nevertheless, Mutchler et al. (1994) stated that micro-scale ROPs are suitable to study basic aspects of soil 10 erosion and further, those measurements are particularly appropriate to define impacts of vegetation by interplot comparison (Wainwright et al., 2000). A major advantage of micro-scale ROPs is the possibility to implement a high number of replications to tackle measurement variability (Wendt et al., 1986). A high number of ROPs in turn requires great efforts in maintenance and control, which are easier to ensure with plots of small 15

scale and small-sized reservoirs (Boix-Fayos et al., 2006).

5 Synthesis and conclusions

20

25

An experiment with 170 micro-scale runoff plots was conducted to investigate the influence of tree species richness and identity as well as tree functional traits on soil erosion processes in a young forest ecosystem. Based on our findings we come to the following conclusions:

1. Tree species richness did not affect sediment discharge and runoff. Although a negative trend was visible from level 1 to 8 and mixed stands showed a more balanced and homogenous vegetation development than monocultures, higher tree species richness is not mitigating soil erosion. We ascribe this effect to the young successional stage of the forest experiment. Future research should concentrate



on how erosion rates change with increasing stand age. Therefore, long-term monitoring of soil erosion under closing tree canopies is necessary.

2. This study provided evidence that different tree species affect interrill erosion processes. Different tree morphologies have to be considered, when regarding erosion in young forest ecosystems. The appropriate choice of tree species for afforestation against soil erosion becomes already important in an early successional stage. *Chorespondeas axillaris,Cyclobalanopsis glauca, Rhus chinensis*, and *Koelreuteria bipinnata* were related to increasing soil erosion rates, whereas *Magnolia yuyuanensis, Lithocarpus glaber, Elaeocarpus chinensis*, and *Liquidambar formosana* can help to mitigate soil erosion in young forest stands.

5

10

15

20

3. Species-specific functional traits and site characteristics affected soil erosion rates. High crown cover and leaf area index reduced soil erosion, whereas it was slightly increased by increasing tree height. Thus, low tree stands with high canopy cover are effectively counteracting soil loss in initial forest ecosystem. In further studies, a wider range of functional tree traits like leaf habitus or below-ground stratification should be taken into consideration. Even if a leaf litter cover was not present in this experiment, the remaining soil surface cover by stones and biological soil crusts was the most important driver for soil erosion control. Furthermore, soil organic matter had a decreasing influence on sediment discharge. Investigations on the influence of topsoil microbial communities and their impact on organic matter accumulation will open the way to new insights on soil erosion processes.

Author contributions. T. Scholten, P. Kühn and S. Seitz designed the experiment and S. Seitz carried it out. S. Seitz, P. Goebes and H. Bruelheide developed the model code and performed the statistics. Y. Li and W. Härdtle provided data on tree growth and species-specific functional traits. S. Seitz prepared the manuscript with contributions from all co-authors.



Acknowledgements. This study was financed by the German Research Foundation (DFG FOR 891/2) in cooperation with the Chinese Academy of Science (CAS). We are grateful to the Sino-German Center for Science Promotion for summer schools and travel grants (GZ 1146). Thanks go to Chen Lin and Zhiqin Pei for organisation and translation in China, Milan Daus

and Kathrin Käppeler for assistance during field work, Bertram Bläschke for the installation of the first ROPs, Mr. Lian and Mr. Liu for technical support in China and finally to our numerous brave Chinese field workers.

References

10

- Abrahams, A. D., Parsons, A. J., and Wainwright, J.: Effects of vegetation change on interrill runoff and erosion, Walnut Gulch, southern Arizona, Geomorphology, 13, 37–48, doi:10.1016/0169-555X(95)00027-3, 1995.
- Agassi, M. and Bradford, J.: Methodologies for interrill soil erosion studies, Soil Till. Res., 49, 277–287, doi:10.1016/S0167-1987(98)00182-2, 1999.

Augusto, L., Ranger, J., Binkley, D., and Rothe, A.: Impact of several common tree

species of European temperate forests on soil fertility, Ann. For. Sci., 59, 233–253, doi:10.1051/forest:2002020, 2002.

Bagarello, V. and Ferro, V.: Plot-scale measurement of soil erosion at the experimental area of Sparacia (southern Italy), Hydrol. Process., 18, 141–157, doi:10.1002/hyp.1318, 2004.
Barnes, B. V. and Spurr, S. H.: Forest ecology, 4th Edn., Wiley, New York, xviii, 774, 1998.

- 20 Barthlott, W., Mutke, J., Rafiqpoor, M. D., Kier, G., and Kreft, H.: Global centres of vascular plant diversity, Nova Act. LC, 92, 61–83, 2005.
 - Bauhus, J. and Schmerbeck, J.: Silvicultural options to enhance and use forest plantation biodiversity, in: Ecosystem goods and services from plantation forests, edited by: Bauhus, J., van der Meer, P., and Kanninen, M., Earthscan, London, Washington, DC, 96–139, 2010.
- Baumann, F., He, J.-S., Schmidt, K., Kühn, P., and Scholten, T.: Pedogenesis, permafrost, and soil moisture as controlling factors for soil nitrogen and carbon contents across the Tibetan Plateau, Glob. Change Biol., 15, 3001–3017, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01953.x, 2009.
 Bautista, S., Mayor, Á. G., Bourakhouadar, J., and Bellot, J.: Plant Spatial Pattern Predicts Hillslope Runoff and Erosion in a Semiarid Mediterranean Landscape, Ecosystems, 10, 987–998, doi:10.1007/s10021-007-9074-3, 2007.



- Berendse, F., van Ruijven, J., Jongejans, E., and Keesstra, S.: Loss of Plant Species Diversity Reduces Soil Erosion Resistance, Ecosystems, doi:10.1007/s10021-015-9869-6, online first, 2015.
- Blanco-Canqui, H. and Lal, R.: Principles of soil conservation and management, Springer, Dordrecht, London, 2008.

5

- Bochet, E., Poesen, J., and Rubio, J. L.: Runoff and soil loss under individual plants of a semiarid Mediterranean shrubland: influence of plant morphology and rainfall intensity, Earth Surf. Proc. Land., 31, 536–549, doi:10.1002/esp.1351, 2006.
- Boix-Fayos, C., Martínez-Mena, M., Arnau-Rosalén, E., Calvo-Cases, A., Castillo, V., and Al-
- ¹⁰ baladejo, J.: Measuring soil erosion by field plots: Understanding the sources of variation, Earth-Sci. Rev., 78, 267–285, doi:10.1016/j.earscirev.2006.05.005, 2006.
 - Brevik, E. C., Cerdà, A., Mataix-Solera, J., Pereg, L., Quinton, J. N., Six, J., and Van Oost, K.: The interdisciplinary nature of *SOIL*, SOIL, 1, 117–129, doi:10.5194/soil-1-117-2015, 2015. Bruelheide, H., Böhnke, M., Both, S., Fang, T., Assmann, T., Baruffol, M., Bauhus, J., Buscot,
- F., Chen, X.-Y., Ding, B.-Y., Durka, W., Erfmeier, A., Fischer, M., Geißler, C., Guo, D., Guo, L.-D., Härdtle, W., He, J.-S., Hector, A., Kröber, W., Kühn, P., Lang, A. C., Nadrowski, K., Pei, K., Scherer-Lorenzen, M., Shi, X., Scholten, T., Schuldt, A., Trogisch, S., von Oheimb, G., Welk, E., Wirth, C., Wu, Y.-T., Yang, X., Zeng, X., Zhang, S., Zhou, H., Ma, K., and Schmid, B.: Community assembly during secondary forest succession in a Chinese subtropical forest, Ecol. Monogr., 81, 25–41, doi:10.1890/09-2172.1, 2011.
 - Bruelheide, H., Nadrowski, K., Assmann, T., Bauhus, J., Both, S., Buscot, F., Chen, X.-Y., Ding, B.-Y., Durka, W., Erfmeier, A., Gutknecht, J. L. M., Guo, D., Guo, L.-D., Härdtle, W., He, J.-S., Klein, A.-M., Kühn, P., Liang, Y., Liu, X., Michalski, S., Niklaus, P. A., Pei, K., Scherer-Lorenzen, M., Scholten, T., Schuldt, A., Seidler, G., Trogisch, S., von Oheimb, G., Welk, E.,
- Wirth, C., Wubet, T., Yang, X., Yu, M., Zhang, S., Zhou, H., Fischer, M., Ma, K., Schmid, B., and Muller-Landau, H. C.: Designing forest biodiversity experiments: general considerations illustrated by a new large experiment in subtropical China, Methods Ecol. Evol., 5, 74–89, doi:10.1111/2041-210X.12126, 2014.

Cantón, Y., Solé-Benet, A., de Vente, J., Boix-Fayos, C., Calvo-Cases, A., Asensio, C., and
 ³⁰ Puigdefábregas, J.: A review of runoff generation and soil erosion across scales in semiarid south-eastern Spain, J. Arid Environ., 75, 1254–1261, doi:10.1016/j.jaridenv.2011.03.004, 2011.



- Chisholm, R. A., Muller-Landau, H. C., Abdul Rahman, K., Bebber, D. P., Bin, Y., Bohlman, S. A., Bourg, N. A., Brinks, J., Bunyavejchewin, S., Butt, N., Cao, H., Cao, M., Cárdenas, D., Chang, L.-W., Chiang, J.-M., Chuyong, G., Condit, R., Dattaraja, H. S., Davies, S., Duque, A., Fletcher, C., Gunatilleke, N., Gunatilleke, S., Hao, Z., Harrison, R. D., Howe, R., Hsieh,
- 5 C.-F., Hubbell, S. P., Itoh, A., Kenfack, D., Kiratiprayoon, S., Larson, A. J., Lian, J., Lin, D., Liu, H., Lutz, J. A., Ma, K., Malhi, Y., McMahon, S., McShea, W., Meegaskumbura, M., Mohd. Razman, S., Morecroft, M. D., Nytch, C. J., Oliveira, A., Parker, G. G., Pulla, S., Punchi-Manage, R., Romero-Saltos, H., Sang, W., Schurman, J., Su, S.-H., Sukumar, R., Sun, I.-F., Suresh, H. S., Tan, S., Thomas, D., Thomas, S., Thompson, J., Valencia, R., Wolf, A., Yap,
- ¹⁰ S., Ye, W., Yuan, Z., Zimmerman, J. K., and Coomes, D. A.: Scale-dependent relationships between tree species richness and ecosystem function in forests, J. Ecol., 101, 1214–1224, doi:10.1111/1365-2745.12132, 2013.
 - Cong, W.-F., van Ruijven, J., Mommer, L., De Deyn, G. B., Berendse, F., Hoffland, E., and Lavorel, S.: Plant species richness promotes soil carbon and nitrogen stocks in grasslands without legumes, J. Ecol., 102, 1163–1170, doi:10.1111/1365-2745.12280, 2014.
- without legumes, J. Ecol., 102, 1163–1170, doi:10.1111/1365-2745.12280, 2014.
 Durán Zuazo, V. H. and Rodríguez Pleguezuelo, C. R.: Soil-erosion and runoff prevention by plant covers. A review, Agron. Sustain. Dev., 28, 65–86, doi:10.1051/agro:2007062, 2008.
 Frasson, R. P. d. M. and Krajewski, W. F.: Characterization of the drop-size distribution and velocity–diameter relation of the throughfall under the maize canopy, Agr. Forest Meteorol.,
- ²⁰ 151, 1244–1251, doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.05.001, 2011.
 - Geißler, C., Kühn, P., Shi, X., and Scholten, T.: Estimation of throughfall erosivity in a highly diverse forest ecosystem using sand-filled splash cups, J. Earth Sci., 21, 897–900, doi:10.1007/s12583-010-0132-y, 2010.

Geißler, C., Kühn, P., Böhnke, M., Bruelheide, H., Shi, X., and Scholten, T.: Splash

- erosion potential under tree canopies in subtropical SE China, CATENA, 91, 85–93, doi:10.1016/j.catena.2010.10.009, 2012a.
 - Geißler, C., Lang, A. C., von Oheimb, G., Härdtle, W., Baruffol, M., and Scholten, T.: Impact of tree saplings on the kinetic energy of rainfall – The importance of stand density, species identity and tree architecture in subtropical forests in China, Agr. Forest Meteorol., 156, 31–
- ³⁰ 40, doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.12.005, 2012b.
 - Geißler, C., Nadrowski, K., Kühn, P., Baruffol, M., Bruelheide, H., Schmid, B., and Scholten, T.: Kinetic energy of Throughfall in subtropical forests of SE China ef-



fects of tree canopy structure, functional traits, and biodiversity, PloS one, 8, e49618, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0049618, 2013.

- Goebes, P., Bruelheide, H., Härdtle, W., Kröber, W., Kühn, P., Li, Y., Seitz, S., von Oheimb, G., and Scholten, T.: Species-specific effects on throughfall kinetic energy in subtropical
- ⁵ forest plantations are related to leaf traits and tree architecture, PloS one, 10, e0128084, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0128084, 2015a.
 - Goebes, P., Seitz, S., Kühn, P., von Oheimb, G., Li, Y., Niklaus, P. A., and Scholten, T.: Throughfall kinetic energy in young subtropical forests: Investigation on tree species richness effects and spatial variability, Agr. Forest Meteorol., in press, 2015b.
- Govers, G. and Poesen, J.: Assessment of the interrill and rill contributions to total soil loss from an upland field plot, Geomorphology, 1, 343–354, doi:10.1016/0169-555X(88)90006-2, 1988.
 - Guerrero-Campo, J., Palacio, S., and Montserrat-Martí, G.: Plant traits enabling survival in Mediterranean badlands in northeastern Spain suffering from soil erosion, J. Veg. Sci., 19, 457–464. doi:10.3170/2008-8-18382. 2008.
 - Guo, Q., Hao, Y., and Liu, B.: Rates of soil erosion in China: A study based on runoff plot data, CATENA, 124, 68–76, doi:10.1016/j.catena.2014.08.013, 2015.

15

20

- Gyssels, G., Poesen, J., Bochet, E., and Li, Y.: Impact of plant roots on the resistance of soils to erosion by water: a review, Prog. Phys. Geog., 29, 189–217, doi:10.1191/0309133305pp443ra, 2005.
- Hooper, D. U., Chapin, F. S., Ewel, J. J., Hector, A., Inchausti, P., Lavorel, S., Lawton, J. H., Lodge, D. M., Loreau, M., Naeem, S., Schmid, B., Setälä, H., Symstad, A. J., Vandermeer, J., and Wardle, D. A.: Effects of Biodiversity on Ecosystem Functioning: A Consensus of Current Knowledge, Ecol. Monogr., 75, 3–35, doi:10.1890/04-0922, 2005.
- ²⁵ Hupp, C. R., Osterkamp, W. R., and Howard, A. D. (Eds.): Biogeomorphology, terrestrial and freshwater systems: Proceedings of the 26th Binghamton Symposium in Geomorphology, 6–8 October 1995, Elsevier, Amsterdam, New York, 347, 1995.
 - IUSS: World reference base for soil resources 2006: A framework for international classification, correlation and communication, 2006 Edn., World soil resources reports, 103, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, ix, 128, 2006.
- Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, ix, 128, 2006. Jacob, M., Viedenz, K., Polle, A., and Thomas, F. M.: Leaf litter decomposition in temperate deciduous forest stands with a decreasing fraction of beech (*Fagus sylvatica*), Oecologia, 164, 1083–1094, doi:10.1007/s00442-010-1699-9, 2010.



Jiao, J., Zhang, Z., Bai, W., Jia, Y., and Wang, N.: Assessing the Ecological Success of Restoration by Afforestation on the Chinese Loess Plateau, Restor. Ecol., 20, 240–249, doi:10.1111/j.1526-100X.2010.00756.x, 2012.

Kelty, M. J.: The role of species mixtures in plantation forestry, Forest Ecol. Manage., 233, 195–204, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2006.05.011, 2006.

5

10

Kim, J. K., Onda, Y., Kim, M. S., and Yang, D. Y.: Plot-scale study of surface runoff on well-covered forest floors under different canopy species, Quaternary Int., 344, 75–85, doi:10.1016/j.quaint.2014.07.036, 2014.

Körner, C. and Spehn, E. M.: Mountain biodiversity: A global assessment, Parthenon Pub. Group, Boca Raton, xiv, 336, 2002.

Kuznetsova, A., Brockhoff, P. B., and Christensen, R. H.: ImerTest: Tests in Linear Mixed Effects Models, available at: http://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/ImerTest/index.html (last access: 22 June 2015), 2014.

Lang, A. C., Härdtle, W., Baruffol, M., Böhnke, M., Bruelheide, H., Schmid, B., von Wehrden,

H., von Oheimb, G., and Acosta, A.: Mechanisms promoting tree species co-existence: Experimental evidence with saplings of subtropical forest ecosystems of China, J. Veg. Sci., 23, 837–846, doi:10.1111/j.1654-1103.2012.01403.x, 2012.

Lang, A. C., Härdtle, W., Bruelheide, H., Geißler, C., Nadrowski, K., Schuldt, A., Yu, M., and von Oheimb, G.: Tree morphology responds to neighbourhood competition and slope

- in species-rich forests of subtropical China, Forest Ecol. Manage., 260, 1708–1715, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2010.08.015, 2010.
 - Lavorel, S. and Garnier, E.: Predicting changes in community composition and ecosystem functioning from plant traits: revisiting the Holy Grail, Funct. Ecol., 16, 545–556, doi:10.1046/j.1365-2435.2002.00664.x, 2002.
- Li, Y., Härdtle, W., Bruelheide, H., Nadrowski, K., Scholten, T., von Wehrden, H., and von Oheimb, G.: Site and neighborhood effects on growth of tree saplings in subtropical plantations (China), Forest Ecol. Manage., 327, 118–127, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2014.04.039, 2014.
 Loreau, M.: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Functioning: Current Knowledge and Future Chal-

lenges, Science, 294, 804–808, doi:10.1126/science.1064088, 2001.

Martin, C., Pohl, M., Alewell, C., Körner, C., and Rixen, C.: Interrill erosion at disturbed alpine sites: Effects of plant functional diversity and vegetation cover, Basic Appl. Ecol., 11, 619– 626, doi:10.1016/j.baae.2010.04.006, 2010.



Discussion

Paper

Discussion

Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper



Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

- Morgan, R. P. C.: Soil erosion and conservation, 3rd Edn., Blackwell Pub., Malden, MA, x, 304, 2005.
- Mutchler, C. K., Murphree, C. E., and McGregor, K. C.: Laboratory and field plots for erosion research, in: Soil erosion research methods, edited by: Lal, R., 2nd Edn., St. Lucie Press;
- Soil and Water Conservation Society, Delray Beach, Fla., Ankeny, IA, 11–38, 1994. Nanko, K., Mizugaki, S., and Onda, Y.: Estimation of soil splash detachment rates on the forest floor of an unmanaged Japanese cypress plantation based on field measurements of throughfall drop sizes and velocities, CATENA, 72, 348–361, doi:10.1016/j.catena.2007.07.002, 2008.
- Nanko, K., Watanabe, A., Hotta, N., and Suzuki, M.: Physical interpretation of the difference in drop size distributions of leaf drips among tree species, Agr. Forest Meteorol., 169, 74–84, doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2012.09.018, 2013.
 - Onda, Y., Gomi, T., Mizugaki, S., Nonoda, T., and Sidle, R. C.: An overview of the field and modelling studies on the effects of forest devastation on flooding and environmental issues, Hvdrol. Process., 24, 527–534, doi:10.1002/hvp.7548, 2010.
- Hydrol. Process., 24, 527–534, doi:10.1002/hyp.7548, 2010.
 Pérez-Harguindeguy, N., Díaz, S., Garnier, E., Lavorel, S., Poorter, H., Jaureguiberry, P., Bret-Harte, M. S., Cornwell, W. K., Craine, J. M., Gurvich, D. E., Urcelay, C., Veneklaas, E. J., Reich, P. B., Poorter, L., Wright, I. J., Ray, P., Enrico, L., Pausas, J. G., de Vos, A. C., Buchmann, N., Funes, G., Quétier, F., Hodgson, J. G., Thompson, K., Morgan, H. D., ter Steege,
- H., Sack, L., Blonder, B., Poschlod, P., Vaieretti, M. V., Conti, G., Staver, A. C., Aquino, S., and Cornelissen, J. H. C.: New handbook for standardised measurement of plant functional traits worldwide, Aust. J. Bot., 61, 167, doi:10.1071/BT12225, 2013.
 - Pimentel, D.: World soil erosion and conservation, Cambridge studies in applied ecology and resource management, 1st Edn., Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, XII, 349 pp., 1993.
- Pimentel, D. and Kounang, N.: Ecology of Soil Erosion in Ecosystems, Ecosystems, 1, 416–426, doi:10.1007/s100219900035, 1998.
 - Pimentel, D., Harvey, C., Resosudarmo, P., Sinclair, K., Kurz, D., McNair, M., Crist, S., Shpritz, L., Fitton, L., Saffouri, R., and Blair, R.: Environmental and Economic Costs of Soil Erosion and Conservation Benefits, Science, 267, 1117–1123, doi:10.1126/science.267.5201.1117, 1995.
 - Pohl, M., Alig, D., Körner, C., and Rixen, C.: Higher plant diversity enhances soil stability in disturbed alpine ecosystems, Plant Soil, 324, 91–102, doi:10.1007/s11104-009-9906-3, 2009.

30



Pohl, M., Graf, F., Buttler, A., and Rixen, C.: The relationship between plant species richness and soil aggregate stability can depend on disturbance, Plant Soil, 355, 87–102, doi:10.1007/s11104-011-1083-5, 2012.

Puettmann, K. J., Coates, K. D., and Messier, C. C.: A critique of silviculture: Managing for complexity, Island Press, Washington, DC, 189, 2009.

5

20

- Puigdefábregas, J.: The role of vegetation patterns in structuring runoff and sediment fluxes in drylands, Earth Surf. Proc. Land., 30, 133–147, doi:10.1002/esp.1181, 2005.
- Quijas, S., Jackson, L. E., Maass, M., Schmid, B., Raffaelli, D., and Balvanera, P.: Plant diversity and generation of ecosystem services at the landscape scale: expert knowledge assessment, J. Appl. Ecol., 49, 929–940, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2664.2012.02153.x, 2012.
- ment, J. Appl. Ecol., 49, 929–940, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2664.2012.02153.x, 2012.
 R Core Team: R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing, R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria, 2013.
 - Razafindrabe, B. H., He, B., Inoue, S., Ezaki, T., and Shaw, R.: The role of forest stand density in controlling soil erosion: implications to sediment-related disasters in Japan, Environ. Monit. Assess., 160, 337–354. doi:10.1007/s10661-008-0699-2, 2010.
- Assess., 160, 337–354, doi:10.1007/s10661-008-0699-2, 2010.
 Richter, G. (Ed.): Bodenerosion: Analyse und Bilanz eines Umweltproblems, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt, 264 pp., 1998.
 - Romero-Diaz, A., Belmonte-Serrato, F., and Ruiz-Sinoga, J. D.: The geomorphic impact of afforestations on soil erosion in Southeast Spain, Land Degrad. Dev., 21, 188–195, doi:10.1002/ldr.946, 2010.
 - Scherer-Lorenzen, M.: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Functioning: Basic Principles, in: Biodiversity: Structure and Function: Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems (EOLSS), Developed under the Auspices of the UNESCO, edited by: Barthlott, W., Linsenmair, K. E., and Porembski, S., Eolss Publishers, Oxford, 2005.
- Scherer-Lorenzen, M.: The functional role of biodiversity in the context of global change, in: Forests and global change, edited by: Coomes, D. A., Burslem, D. F. R. P., and Simonson, W. D., Ecological reviews, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, New York, 195–238, 2014.

Seitz, S., Goebes, P., Zumstein, P., Schuldt, A., Assmann, T., Kühn, P., Niklaus, P. A., and Scholten, T.: The influence of leaf litter diversity and soil fauna on initial soil erosion in sub-

tropical forests, Earth Surf. Proc. Land., online first, doi:10.1002/esp.3726, 2015.



725

- Stokes, A., Atger, C., Bengough, A. G., Fourcaud, T., and Sidle, R. C.: Desirable plant root traits for protecting natural and engineered slopes against landslides, Plant Soil, 324, 1–30, doi:10.1007/s11104-009-0159-y, 2009.
- Swanson, M. E., Franklin, J. F., Beschta, R. L., Crisafulli, C. M., DellaSala, D. A., Hutto,
- R. L., Lindenmayer, D. B., and Swanson, F. J.: The forgotten stage of forest succession: early-successional ecosystems on forest sites, Front. Ecol. Environ., 9, 117–125, doi:10.1890/090157, 2011.
 - Thornes, J. B.: Vegetation and erosion: Processes and environments, British Geomorphological Research Group symposia series, J. Wiley, Chichester, West Sussex, England, New York, NY, USA, 518, 1990.
- Tsujimura, M., Onda, Y., and Harada, D.: The Role of Horton Overland Flow in Rainfall-runoff Process in an Unchanneled Catchment Covered by Unmanaged Hinoki Plantation, Journal of Japan Society of Hydrology & Water Resources, 19, 17–24, doi:10.3178/jjshwr.19.17, 2006.

10

20

- Vilà, M., Vayreda, J., Comas, L., Ibáñez, J. J., Mata, T., and Obón, B.: Species richness and
 wood production: a positive association in Mediterranean forests, Ecol. Lett., 10, 241–250, doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2007.01016.x, 2007.
 - Wainwright, J., Parsons, A. J., and Abrahams, A. D.: Plot-scale studies of vegetation, overland flow and erosion interactions: case studies from Arizona and New Mexico, Hydrol. Process., 14, 2921–2943, doi:10.1002/1099-1085(200011/12)14:16/17<2921::AID-HYP127>3.0.CO;2-7, 2000.
 - Wendt, R. C., Alberts, E. E., and Hjelmfelt, A. T.: Variability of Runoff and Soil Loss from Fallow Experimental Plots, Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J., 50, 730, doi:10.2136/sssaj1986.03615995005000030035x, 1986.
- Wischmeier, W. H. and Smith, D. D.: Predicting rainfall erosion losses: a guide to conservation planning, Agriculture handbook, 537, Washington, D.C., 1978.
 - Xu, X.-L., Ma, K.-M., Fu, B.-J., Song, C.-J., and Liu, W.: Influence of three plant species with different morphologies on water runoff and soil loss in a dry-warm river valley, SW China, Forest Ecol. Manage., 256, 656–663, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2008.05.015, 2008.
- Yin, S., Xie, Y., Nearing, M. A., and Wang, C.: Estimation of rainfall erosivity using 5- to 60-minute fixed-interval rainfall data from China, CATENA, 70, 306–312, doi:10.1016/j.catena.2006.10.011, 2007.



Zhao, H.-L., He, Y.-H., Zhou, R.-L., Su, Y.-Z., Li, Y.-Q., and Drake, S.: Effects of desertification on soil organic C and N content in sandy farmland and grassland of Inner Mongolia, CATENA, 77, 187–191, doi:10.1016/j.catena.2008.12.007, 2009.

Zheng, J.-J., He, X.-B., Walling, D., Zhang, X.-B., Flanagan, D., and Qi, Y.-Q.: Assessing Soil
 ⁵ Erosion Rates on Manually-Tilled Hillslopes in the Sichuan Hilly Basin Using 137Cs and
 210Pbex Measurements, Pedosphere, 17, 273–283, doi:10.1016/S1002-0160(07)60034-4,
 2007.

Zhou, G., Wei, X., and Yan, J.: Impacts of eucalyptus (Eucalyptus exserta) plantation on sediment yield in Guangdong Province, Southern China – a kinetic energy approach, CATENA, 49, 231–251, doi:10.1016/S0341-8162(02)00030-9, 2002.

10

Zhu, T. X. and Zhu, A. X.: Assessment of soil erosion and conservation on agricultural sloping lands using plot data in the semi-arid hilly loess region of China, J. Hydrol.: Regional Studies, 2, 69–83, doi:10.1016/j.ejrh.2014.08.006, 2014.



| Discussion Pa | SO 2, 701–7 | ILD 36, 2015 |
|-----------------|--|---|
| aper Discussi | Tree dive interrill proce S. Seit | rsity and erosion esses z et al. |
| on Paper | Title I Abstract | Page Introduction |
| Discuss | Conclusions Tables | References Figures |
| ion Paper | I⊲ ⊲ Back | ►I ► Close |
| Discuss | Full Scre | een / Esc Idly Version |
| sion Paper | | Discussion |

Table 1. Characteristics of rainfall events considered erosive (threshold 12.7 mm) in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China in May and June 2013.

| Event | Mean intensity (mm h ⁻¹) | Peak intensity (mm h ⁻¹) | Total rainfall amount (mm) |
|-------|---|---|-------------------------------|
| E 1 | 1.38 | 11.4 | 20.29 |
| E 2 | 2.34 | 23.04 | 25.74 |
| E 3 | 3.19 | 45.24 | 54.42 |
| E 4 | 14.60 | 83.04 | 34.01 |

Table 2. Discharge rates and growth characteristics (means) of tree species with significant differences in sediment discharge at the experimental site in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China.

| | Sediment discharge (g m ⁻²) | Crown cover (%) | Leaf area index | Tree height (m) | Stem diameter (m) | Crown width (m) |
|----------------|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| Mean | 199 | 32 | 0.75 | 1.84 | 0.03 | 0.94 |
| Monocultures | 202 | 22 | 0.63 | 1.63 | 0.02 | 0.78 |
| Tree mixtures | 135 | 44 | 1.18 | 2.30 | 0.04 | 1.26 |
| Ch. axillaris | 566 | 90 | 2.27 | 7.40 | 0.07 | 2.21 |
| C. glauca | 556 | 51 | 0.93 | 1.25 | 0.02 | 0.65 |
| R. chinensis | 502 | 47 | 0.85 | 1.82 | 0.03 | 1.62 |
| K. bipinnata | 378 | 19 | 0.30 | 1.97 | 0.03 | 1.15 |
| M. yuyuanensis | 64 | 11 | 0.14 | 1.62 | 0.04 | 0.95 |
| L. glaber | 114 | 20 | 0.28 | 2.32 | 0.03 | 1.09 |
| E. chinensis | 66 | 64 | 1.02 | 2.19 | 0.05 | 0.97 |
| L. formosana | 91 | 15 | 0.19 | 2.28 | 0.04 | 1.64 |

| SO | SOILD | | | | | |
|---|--------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 2, 701–7 | 2, 701–736, 2015 | | | | | |
| Tree diversity and interrill erosion processes S. Seitz et al. | | | | | | |
| Title | Page | | | | | |
| Abstract | Introduction | | | | | |
| Conclusions | References | | | | | |
| Tables | Figures | | | | | |
| ◄ | ۲I | | | | | |
| • | • | | | | | |
| Back | Close | | | | | |
| Full Scr | een / Esc | | | | | |
| Printer-frie | Printer-friendly Version | | | | | |
| Interactive | Discussion | | | | | |
| CC ① | | | | | | |

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Table 3. Growth characteristics of the 20 tree species analysed and associated plot characteristics in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China (mean, standard deviation (SD), maximum (max) and minimum (min)).

| | Mean | SD | Max | Min |
|-----------------------------------|------|------|------|------|
| Vegetation | | | | |
| Crown cover (%) | 37 | 31 | 93 | 1 |
| Leaf area index (LAI) | 0.88 | 1.08 | 4.20 | 0.03 |
| Tree height (m) | 2.55 | 1.64 | 7.40 | 1.16 |
| Stem diameter (m) | 0.04 | 0.02 | 0.07 | 0.02 |
| Crown width (m) | 1.25 | 0.61 | 3.00 | 0.40 |
| Site | | | | |
| Soil surface cover (%) | 16 | 14 | 55 | 1 |
| Bulk soil density ($g cm^{-3}$) | 0.99 | 0.05 | 1.12 | 0.91 |
| Soil organic matter (%) | 6.4 | 1.4 | 9.4 | 4.3 |
| pH | 3.68 | 0.24 | 4.39 | 3.25 |
| Slope (°) | 27 | 5 | 35 | 19 |



Discussion SOILD 2,701-736,2015 Paper Tree diversity and interrill erosion processes Discussion Paper S. Seitz et al. **Title Page** Abstract Introduction Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper Tables Figures Back Close Full Screen / Esc **Discussion** Paper Printer-friendly Version Interactive Discussion

Table A1. 22 selected tree species used in the experiment according to the Flora of China (http://www.efloras.org). Asterisks (*) mark species which only appear in mixtures.

Species name and author

Ailanthus altissima (Miller) Swingle Alniphyllum fortunei (Hemsl.) Makino Betula luminifera H. Winkl. Castanea henryi (Skan) Rehd. et Wils. Castanopsis fargesii Franch. Castanopsis sclerophylla (Lindl.) Schott. Choerospondias axillaris (Roxb.) Burtt et Hill. Cyclobalanopsis glauca (Thunb.) Oerst. Elaeocarpus chinensis Gardn. et Chanp. Elaeocarpus glabripetalus Merr. Elaeocarpus japonicus Sieb. et Zucc. Koelreuteria bipinnata Franch. Liquidambar formosana Hance Lithocarpus glaber (Thunb.) Nakai Magnolia yuyuanensis Hu Nyssa sinensis Oliver* Rhus chinensis Mill. Sapindus saponaria Gaertn. Schima superba Gardn. et Champ. Triadica sebifera (L.) Roxb. Quercus fabri Hance Quercus phillyreoides A. Gray* Table A2. Results of the basic linear mixed effect model for sediment discharge. Crown cover was highly correlated with the four other vegetation characteristics and therefore, they have been exchanged and fitted in separate models.

| | | denDF | F | Pr | | estimates |
|-----------|-------------------------------|-----------|-------------|---------|------|-----------|
| Fixed | Surface runoff | 204 | 49.0 | < 0.001 | *** | (–) 0.33 |
| effects | Crown cover | 120 | 7.25 | 0.008 | ** | (–) 0.18 |
| | Slope | 141 | 1.33 | 0.250 | n.s. | (-) 0.05 |
| | Surface cover | 140 | 56.1 | < 0.001 | *** | (-) 0.46 |
| | Soil organic matter | 42 | 5.61 | 0.022 | * | (-) 0.07 |
| | Precipitation | 70 | 0.12 | 0.733 | n.s. | (–) 0.01 |
| | Tree species richness | 25 | 0.30 | 0.589 | n.s. | (–) 0.05 |
| | | SD | variance | | | |
| Random | Precipitation event: plot | 0.204 | 0.042 | | | |
| effects | Tree composition | 0.332 | 0.110 | | | |
| | Site | 0.577 | 0.333 | | | |
| | Plot: rop | 0.503 | 0.253 | | | |
| Vegetatio | n characteristics fitted in e | xchange t | o crown cov | /er | | |
| | Leaf area index | 95 | 5.16 | 0.026 | * | (–) 0.17 |
| | Tree height | 31 | 3.58 | 0.069 | • | (–) 0.10 |
| | Tree stem diameter | 30 | 0.20 | 0.661 | n.s. | (-) 0.04 |
| | Tree crown width | 31 | 0.79 | 0.383 | n.s. | (-) 0.08 |

* p < 0.001, ** p < 0.01, * p < 0.05, * p < 0.1, n.s. not significant; n = 334. ***

| Discussion Pa | SOII 2, 701–73 | _D 6, 2015 |
|----------------------|--|--------------------------------------|
| tper Discussion | Tree divers interrill e proces S. Seitz | sity and rosion sses et al. |
| Pape | Title Pa | age |
| - | Abstract | Introduction |
| _ | Conclusions | References |
| Discuss | Tables | Figures |
| sion | ∢ | ۲I |
| Pape | • | • |
| ~ | Back | Close |
| Dis | Full Scree | n / Esc |
| cus | Printer-friend | y Version |
| sion P | Interactive D | scussion |
| aper | |) v |

| | Discussion Pa | SOI 2, 701–73 | I LD 36, 2015 |
|----|---------------|--|---|
| | aper Discus | Tree dive interrill proce S. Seit | rsity and erosion esses z et al. |
| rd | sion | | |
| _ | Paper | Title F Abstract | Page Introduction |
| _ | — | Conclusions | References |
| _ | Discus | Tables | Figures |
| | sion | | ►I |
| _ | Pap | • | • |
| | er | Back | Close |
| | Die | Full Scre | en / Esc |
| | SCUS | Printer-frien | dly Version |
| | sion Pa | Interactive | Discussion |
| | per | \odot | BY |

Table A3. Mean sediment discharge in $g m^{-2}$ and surface runoff volume in $L m^{-2}$ (standard deviation in brackets, n = 334) for tree species richness in May and June 2013.

| | Diversity |
|--------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| | 0–24 | 0 | 1–24 | 1 | 8 | 16 | 24 |
| Sediment discharge | 199 | 361 | 188 | 202 | 103 | 135 | 204 |
| | (106) | (187) | (90) | (105) | (57) | (123) | (107) |
| Runoff | 32.6 | 47.8 | 29.8 | 31.9 | 27.5 | 22.5 | 30.2 |
| volume | (21.4) | (32.1) | (18.5) | (20.9) | (14.5) | (15.7) | (19.7) |



Figure 1. Measurement setup showing a runoff plot (ROP, $0.4 \text{ m} \times 0.4 \text{ m}$) with reservoir and rainfall gauge on the experimental site in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China.





Figure 2. Sediment discharge and runoff volume at five diversity levels based on four rainfall events in May and June 2013 in Xingangshan, Jiangxi Province, PR China (n.s.: not significant, n = 334). Horizontal line within boxplot represents median and diamond represents mean.









