

Interactive comment on “Influence of long-term mineral fertilization on metal contents and properties of soil samples taken from different locations in Hesse, Germany” by S. Czarnecki and R.-A. Düring

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 1 July 2014

Here the authors investigated the effects of mineral fertilization on soil chemical properties with emphasis on metal contents. There is not much novelty in the study and the presentation should be improved. On the other hand, the manuscript provides new long-term data that may be interesting for the journal readership. Yet the metal contents of the fertilizers applied need to be reported and discussed; otherwise, the manuscript would be of limited value.

p. 240, l. 16-17: “Fertilization is...” This sentence belongs in the Introduction and/or

C20

at the beginning of the Abstract. p. 244, l. 6-8: “The results of statistical...” These two sentences belong in Figure captions. Alphabetical? p. 244, l. 10: “evidently”, “considerable”... These terms are too ambiguous/vague and should be avoided. p. 245, l. 3: Delete “conspicuous” p. 245, l. 16: “Affection”? p. 247, l. 8-11: This belongs in the MM section. p. 249, l. 3-10: This text belongs in the MM/introductions sections. p. 250-251: The Conclusions section is just a summary of the manuscript; it should be rewritten. Figures 1 and 2: Bar graphs would be more appropriate.

Interactive comment on SOIL Discuss., 1, 239, 2014.

C21